Appraisal Environmental and Social Review Summary
Appraisal Stage
(ESRS Appraisal Stage)

Date Prepared/Updated: 05/23/2019 | Report No: ESRSA00163

BASIC INFORMATION

A. Basic Project Data

Country	Region	Project ID	Parent Project ID (if any)
Grenada	LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN	P167588	

Project Name	Digital Government for Resilience		

Practice Area (Lead)	Financing Instrument	Estimated Appraisal Date	Estimated Board Date
Governance	Investment Project Financing	5/15/2019	7/31/2019

Borrower(s)	Implementing Agency(ies)		
Grenada	Ministry of Infrastructure Development, Public Utilities, Energy, Transport and Implementation		

Proposed Development Objective(s)

To enhance the efficiency, usage and resilience of selected government digital services.

Financing (in USD Million)	Amount
Total Project Cost	**15.00**

B. Is the project being prepared in a Situation of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints, as per Bank IPF Policy, para. 12?

No

C. Summary Description of Proposed Project [including overview of Country, Sectoral & Institutional Contexts and Relationship to CPF]

The project will aim to build a smart, resilient government that adopts a whole-of-government approach to implementing critical public policies and increasing the efficiency of public service delivery by 1) developing the enabling environment to modernize service delivery; 2) leveraging digital technologies to deliver selected e-services to citizens; and 3) strengthening institutions and change management. It will focus on developing the institutional efficiency and resilience of key aspects public sector administration that drive the growth of a digital economy and ensure government continuity. The operation will complement the ongoing and upcoming investments in IT

infrastructure in the country and develop digital government platforms to improve government productivity and accountability and enhance social inclusiveness. It will advocate, where appropriate, the use of disruptive technologies across policy areas and levels of government, with a focus on supporting government continuity and climate adaptation, developing citizen-centric public services, and promoting digital literacy in the public sector and for citizens.

D. Environmental and Social Overview

D.1. Project location(s) and salient characteristics relevant to the ES assessment [geographic, environmental, social]

Grenada is a small, open island economy of approximately 110,000 inhabitants. The country is highly vulnerable to weather events, volatile terms of trade, and economic downturns in external markets that impact tourism and foreign direct investment. The country has experienced notable gains in social development over the past two decades. However, poverty rate and inequality have remained high. The implementation of public management functions suffers from weaknesses resulting from outdated systems, low human resource capacity, limited strategic planning, and weak information management. The identity management system in Grenada is fragmented and complex, with multiple identity systems such as the births and deaths registry, the electoral card system and the passport issuance platform, none of which interface with each other. The project will occur in public sector ministry offices, other offices in Grenada, in communities (a participatory approach) and in partnerships to promote change and drive reforms. The project aims to build a resilient and smart government that adopts a whole -of- government approach to implementing critical public policies and services by: 1) developing the enabling environment to modernize service delivery; 2) leveraging digital technologies to deliver targeted e-services to citizens; and 3) strengthening institutions for digital governance and managing change for digital literacy and inclusion. These are to be achieved in consultation and collaboration with the citizens and the local private sector.

D. 2. Borrower's Institutional Capacity

Overall management of the project will be led by a Project Manager. The Project Manager will be responsible for managing the coordination, monitoring, evaluation and safeguard functions related to the project. Since Grenada's capacity is moderate for safeguards management, a consultant will be recruited part-time to manage the relatively minor environmental and social safeguard risks. All PIU staff will sit in the Ministry of Infrastructure. The project will address capacity building within the e-services sector, including leveraging digital technologies to deliver resilient integrated services to citizens and forging inclusive strategic partnerships to stimulate a data driven culture in the public sector.

II. SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL (ES) RISKS AND IMPACTS

A. Environmental and Social Risk Classification (ESRC)   Moderate

Environmental Risk Rating   Low

The environmental risk classification is low because the project will not result in any medium or large scale works. The project is largely focused on capacity building in e-technology as well as putting in place e-services, e-identification systems and digital platforms. For example, Component 1 will support the Government of Grenada (GOG) in designing and implementing the institutional, regulatory, and procedural improvements (including digital platforms that would underpin these improvements) to enhance internal administrative efficiencies and collaboration across government entities. Component 2 will build on the technologies introduced under the first component,

including the single sign-on digital identifier and resilient e-payment system, to enable the government to introduce two high priority and high impact public services (civil registry and taxes.) Component 3 will introduce a comprehensive package of interventions to strengthen the institutional coordination and management mechanisms as well as ensure that the public sector and citizens develop the digital literacy and necessary awareness skills. Component 2 will have some small works associated with putting in place e-service platforms, as well as replacing older computers, software, and computer networks. The works will largely take place in pre-existing offices. These works, including those related to retrofitting spaces to enable public access, may include re-wiring, moving furniture, drilling holes in walls, etc. The risks are therefore minor and fully reversible. Waste disposal is the main environmental issue, particularly if there are existing old computer equipment to be replaced. An e-waste management plan will be developed three months after project effectiveness or before replacement of equipment, whichever comes first, as outlined in the ESCP, to reduce the waste stream that may end up in the landfill.

Social Risk Rating   Moderate

The Bank classifies the Social risk of the project as "Moderate" after considering, in an integrated manner the following risks: further exacerbating existing exclusion patterns if careful attention is not given to addressing both inclusion and exclusion errors in the current access to public services. If not mitigated, the digitization of identity and registration systems that govern the access to services could become a vehicle for increased exclusion. In contrast, explicit attention to addressing any exclusion errors could significantly increase reach and coverage of services.

The project is concerned about these risks and will adopt a participatory and inclusive approach to enhance social inclusiveness, and forge partnerships across the public sector, the private sector, and civil society. This approach will be adopted in the implementation of all project's major components, where citizen satisfaction is one of the project's key results.

As for now, the Bank does not envisage the potential for privacy concerns from citizens and issues of limitations in access by vulnerable or marginalized people or groups. The Bank will review the Environmental and Social Risk Classification (ESRC) on a regular basis throughout the project life cycle to ensure that it continues to accurately reflect the level of risk the project presents.

B. Environment and Social Standards (ESSs) that Apply to the Activities Being Considered

B.1. General Assessment

ESS1 Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts

Overview of the relevance of the Standard for the Project:

The standard is relevant since the project's activities are likely to result in the generation of e-waste (equipment for disposal). The size of this waste stream is still under assessment as the project continues preparation activities. The capacity of the GoG to manage e-waste is low, and although Government reports that the current e-waste stream is small, it all ends up at the city dump. For these reasons, an e-waste management plan (EWMP) will be developed and in place prior to the replacing of old equipment. Since the GOG has not before developed an EWMP , they will recruit a regional or international expert to assist them with its preparation. Key operational health and safety guidelines that must be adhered to during installation works will be outlined in contracts. For this project, the main environmental safeguards instruments will be a (i)screening tool to assess the risk related to particular works related

activities; (ii) operational health and safety guidelines (in the Project Operational Manual (POM)) and (iii) an EWMP. The project impacts may fall disproportionately on persons who are subjected to prejudice or discrimination - women, children, minorities with disadvantages, the elderly, poor people that live in slums, LGBT, people with disabilities. For example, people who are blind are especially likely to be excluded from accessing improvements in e-services that require a visual interface. Measures to mitigate their exclusion, such as screen readers - a form of assistive technology (AT) which is essential to people who are blind, as well as useful to people who are visually impaired, illiterate, or have a learning disability- will be considered. The project will seek to incorporate data privacy approach to help prevent breaches and enforce security. The project will also consider ergonomic issues related to data entry as well as access to systems and platforms by those with physical limitations. An ESCP and a SEP plan have been developed.

ESS10 Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure

The standard is relevant. The main stakeholders are Government workers and officials as well as the public who will access these e-services. The Government has developed a Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) that outlines a) who the key stakeholders are; b) how they are to be engaged; c) how often the engagement will occur throughout the project; d) how feedback will be solicited, recorded and monitored over the project; e) who will be charged/responsible with this engagement; f) timeline for this engagement. The process of stakeholder engagement has begun during preparation and will continue into implementation. Prior to appraisal, the following measures will be implemented: i) stakeholder identification and analysis and ii) planning the engagement with stakeholders, iii) disclosure of information and iv) consultation with stakeholders. The SEP is expected to be updated from time to time as/if necessary. The SEP will also describe the measures that will be used to remove obstacles to participation, and how the views of differently affected groups will be captured. Where applicable, the SEP will include differentiated measures to allow the effective participation of those identified as disadvantaged or vulnerable. Dedicated approaches and an increased level of resources may be needed for communication with such differently affected groups so that they can obtain the information they need regarding the issues that will potentially affect (positively or negatively) them. The Borrower will propose and implement a grievance mechanism to receive concerns and grievances and facilitate their resolution.

B.2. Specific Risks and Impacts

A brief description of the potential environmental and social risks and impacts relevant to the Project.

ESS2 Labor and Working Conditions

This standard is relevant given the potential for hiring specialized personnel and laborers for different aspects of project implementation including system design and physical works for installations. Some few unskilled workers may be hired to perform small, repetitive, and unskilled tasks. At a later date, the project will provide TORs for workers to be hired. If government civil servants will work in connection with the project, whether full-time or part-time, they will remain subject to the terms and conditions of their existing public-sector employment agreement or arrangement, unless there has been an effective legal transfer of their employment or engagement to the project. ESS2 will not apply to such government civil servants, except for the provisions of Protecting the Work Force Occupational Health and Safety. The project does not intend to be engaged with primary supplier workers. The project does not intend to include the use of community workers. The WBG team will review the specific HR

processes and practices for the project in line with due requirements. This includes some requirements in the contracts for third party employers as well as the process for a grievance mechanism and occupational health and safety practices.

ESS3 Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention and Management

This standard is relevant.

The project is not expected to cause air, water, soil or other pollution. However, e-waste, if handled incorrectly, could result in soil and water pollution. For that reason, computers, servers and other equipment that may be replaced will have to be disposed of in a manner that follows specific guidelines as articulated in a waste management plan. In addition, procurement bidding documents will specify the need to meet certified energy standards and this will also be outlined in the operational manual. The specific energy standard to meet will be based on the availability, cost and utility of the item to be procured.

In terms of efficiency, the project will ensure that the equipment it procures is energy efficient to the extent possible. For servers and computer equipment, lower energy models will be sourced.

ESS4 Community Health and Safety

This Standard is relevant.

The project will help establish service centers where members of the community can engage in e-services, whether it is to pay bills or other types of transactions. Installation works will also largely take place in Government office buildings that will have staff performing their normal day to day duties. These works, including those related to retrofitting spaces to enable public access, may include re-wiring, moving furniture, drilling holes in walls, etc. Although these works will be small, it would be important to ensure that the public does not enter these work zones. Signage, and fencing where appropriate, will be needed to cordon off entryways, to ensure public safety. This will be contained in the occupational health and safety plan outlined in the POM.

The client will consider issues of public safety during construction/repairs in buildings that will be retrofitted for the systems provided. Universal access will also be considered for buildings retrofitted for public use and access.

ESS5 Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement

This standard is currently not relevant.

The project is not expected to generate any physical infrastructure (e.g. construction of buildings or of fiber optic or transmission towers), and therefore will not include the taking of land either by involuntary or voluntary means. If,

against all expectations, land is acquired, then respective plans to address these new risks will be reflected in a revised Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP,) and implemented prior to any purchase.

ESS6 Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources

This standard is not currently relevant.

The project does not involve risks or potential impacts to biodiversity or natural habitats, nor does it involve sustainable management of living natural resources.

All activities will take place within existing buildings and therefore there will be no impact on living natural resources.

ESS7 Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities

The standard is not relevant. Previous social assessment undertaken by previous World Bank Projects, concluded that no indigenous communities are present in project area. There are populations who are self-identified as indigenous descent in the project area. However, these groups no longer retain the minimum characteristics necessary to claim indigenous group affiliation under Bank Policy: such as Collective attachment to geographically distinct habitats, ancestral territories, or areas of seasonal use or occupation, as well as to the natural resources in these areas. The main screening methodology is based on a review of secondary literature and empirical knowledge of the project's area.

ESS8 Cultural Heritage

This Standard is not currently relevant.

No physical infrastructure and/or excavation work will be undertaken. The project does not envisage any impacts on physical, cultural, and/or archeological sites.

ESS9 Financial Intermediaries

This standard is not relevant.

The project does not involve a financial intermediary as defined by ESS9

B.3 Other Relevant Project Risks

None

C. Legal Operational Policies that Apply

OP 7.50 Projects on International Waterways   No

OP 7.60 Projects in Disputed Areas	No

III. BORROWER'S ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL COMMITMENT PLAN (ESCP)

DELIVERABLES against MEASURES AND ACTIONs IDENTIFIED	TIMELINE
ESS 1 Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts	
E-waste management plan will be developed 3 months after project effectiveness, or before replacement of the old computers, whichever comes first. A technical consultant may be recruited to develop this plan.	11/2019
ESS 10 Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure	
Stakeholder engagement plan	05/2019
Grievance Redressal Mechanism	
ESS 2 Labor and Working Conditions	
Labour Management Procedure	11/2019
Grievance Redress Mechanism for workers	11/2019
Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) measures.	11/2019
ESS 3 Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention and Management	
E-waste management plan	11/2019
ESS 4 Community Health and Safety	
Occupational health and safety plan outlined in the POM.	11/2019
ESS 5 Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement	
Not applicable	
ESS 6 Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources	
Not applicable	
ESS 7 Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities	
Not applicable	

ESS 8 Cultural Heritage	
Not applicable	
ESS 9 Financial Intermediaries	
Not applicable	

B.3. Reliance on Borrower's policy, legal and institutional framework, relevant to the Project risks and impacts

Is this project being prepared for use of Borrower Framework?   No

Areas where "Use of Borrower Framework" is being considered:

Not applicable

IV. CONTACT POINTS

World Bank

Contact:	Leah April	Title:	Senior Public Sector Specialist
Telephone No:	5220+88805 /	Email:	lapril@worldbank.org
Contact:	Onur Erdem	Title:	Public Sector Specialist
Telephone No:	1-202-473-26	Email:	oerdem@worldbank.org
Contact:	Raman V. Krishnan	Title:	Senior Digital Development Specialist
Telephone No:	473-2304	Email:	rkrishnan7@worldbank.org

Borrower/Client/Recipient

Borrower: Grenada

Implementing Agency(ies)

Implementing Agency: Ministry of Infrastructure Development, Public Utilities, Energy, Transport and Implementation

V. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT

The World Bank
1818 H Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20433
Telephone: (202) 473-1000
Web: http://www.worldbank.org/projects

VI. APPROVAL

Task Team Leader(s):	Leah April, Onur Erdem, Raman V. Krishnan

Practice Manager (ENR/Social)	Maria Gonzalez de Asis Cleared on 02-May-2019 at 18:48:24 EDT