CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT AT THE MILLENNIUM

The Challenge and the Response

The World Bank
CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT
AT THE MILLENNIUM
CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT AT THE MILLENNIUM
The Challenge and the Response

Foreword by James D. Wolfensohn
Edited by Ismail Serageldin

The World Bank
Contents

Foreword, 7
James D. Wolfensohn

Memory and Vision: Cultural Identity in a Changing World, 8
Ismail Serageldin

The Challenge: A Heritage at Risk
Living Culture: Globalization and the Loss of Identity, 16
Defining Priorities: The World Heritage List, 19
Pollution, Construction and the Loss of World Heritage, 20

The Response: Pragmatism and Vision
Cultural Heritage Continuity and Renewal, 24
UNESCO: A Global Commitment to Cultural Heritage and Development, 27
Position of The World Bank, 28
Investing in Culture: The Economic and Financial Calculus, 31

Partnership for Action: A Coalition of the Caring
An Alliance for Culture and Development, 34
UNESCO: The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, 36
The Getty Conservation Institute, 42
Council of Europe, 48
Smithsonian Institution, 52
Aga Khan Trust for Culture, 56
World Monuments Fund, 60
ICRROM: International Center for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property, 64
Organization of American States, 68
Inter-American Development Bank, 72
The World Bank, 76

Acknowledgments, 87
At the threshold of the third millennium, the world is in the throes of unprecedented globalization. Many individuals, especially in the developing countries, feel themselves increasingly powerless against the vast forces of global change. Yet, along with globalization has come an unprecedented assertion of individual identity.

This rich cultural diversity is not just a treasure that we must rejoice in, it deserves to be protected every bit as much as our planet’s biodiversity. But more than that, the self-awareness and pride that comes from cultural identity is an essential part of empowering communities to take charge of their own destinies. It is for these reasons that we at the World Bank believe that respect for the culture and identity of peoples is an important element in any viable approach to people-centered development.

We must respect the rootedness of people in their own societal context. We must protect the heritage of the past. But we must also foster and promote living culture in all its many forms. As recent economic analyses have consistently shown, this also makes sound business sense. From tourism to restoration, investments, and cultural heritage and related industries promote labor intensive economic activities that generate wealth and income.

Much of this is already happening or beginning to happen in the context of our conventional operations. Educational loans can take into account the needs of libraries and museums, essential elements of the educational enterprise of any nation today. Historic districts can be more sensitively treated in urban development. Natural sites can be protected through environmental operations and so much more.

The World Bank does not claim to be the custodian of all knowledge in this area. We recognize that the very logic of these activities is that they must be home grown and country driven. But there is much that can be done through partnerships. Partnerships that bring together the international, regional, national, and local actors. Partnerships that bridge formal and informal, private and public. Partnerships that bring in foundations, civil society, and the communities themselves, as well as national governments and international agencies.

I am thus delighted to see more of our work being done in collaboration with the many institutions that have been leaders in this field over the years: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the Getty Conservation Institute, the International Center for the Study of Preservation and the Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), the World Monument Fund (WMF), the Aga Khan Trust for Culture (AKTC), the Council of Europe, the Smithsonian Institution, the Organization of American States and so many more.

I believe that as we advance in the years ahead, this work will be increasingly essential to promote social solidarity, to respond to the challenge of inclusion, and to help new generations build a better future on the solid and sustainable foundations of their past.

James D. Wolfensohn
President
The World Bank
Memory and Vision: 
Cultural Identity in a Changing World

The world is in the grip of profound transformations, as globalization makes the planet an ever smaller place. Revolutions in telecommunications and capital flows have created bonds across the continents, and the ubiquity of consumer items are calling into question the very sense of place and of local identity. The emerging consciousness of our common humanity, be it in terms of human rights or gender issues, as well as our common stewardship of the earth and its limited resources have transcended the boundaries of nations and made us all citizens of the world.

Yet, profound unease continues. The sense of being buffeted by unseen forces, of losing control of our very individuality and identity is pervasive. Rising inequities between and within nations fray the implicit social contract, and globalization feeds a concern for local specificity. Taking charge of our destinies requires an understanding of who we are, of the kind of community and society in which we function, and a sense of purpose about the kind of future we want to fashion. It is in addressing these kinds of questions that the links between culture and development become inextricably intertwined.

Culture in a Changing World

Let us start with a definition of the term "culture." We use it in the same sense as it has been used by UNESCO and by the World Commission on Culture and Development that gave us the 1995 report on "Our Creative Diversity." Culture is the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions, and beliefs.

And how does this relate the specificity of each society and the sweeping currents of globalization? To education and technology? To knowledge and science? How can we recognize the unique features of local communities, while affirming the universals that hold nations together and that join us all in a common humanity? How can we promote employment and tourism without denaturing the cultural assets that motivate the tourism in the first place? How can one translate responses to these questions into specific actions beneficial to the developing countries of the world and to the poor, who are our primary concern?

These questions are not new, and many have struggled with them for a very long time. UNESCO has been at the forefront of these efforts for over half a century and most recently a distinguished commission, headed by former Secretary-General of the United Nations Perez de Cuellar, produced an important volume on "Our Creative Diversity." But the arguments put forth in that important report take on a new urgency in the light of accelerating change and globalization, the volatility of international markets, and the challenge of promoting social inclusion and empowerment.

Against this background and under the leadership of its visionary president, James D. Wolfensohn, the World Bank has embarked on an effort to mainstream its concern for culture in its drive for poverty reduction, empowerment, and social inclusion. This book is a catalogue of a traveling exhibition that is being launched at the World Bank in September 1998 with the intention of sketching out the current thinking in the Bank on these issues and celebrating the work of many partners who are active in these areas, as well as explaining what the Bank is doing in this domain. The works presented in this exhibition are those of international agencies
involved in supporting the actions of the countless communities in the developing
countries who are taking charge of their own destinies. These projects are there­
fore celebrations of those who have addressed these issues in the developing world,
and of those who have supported them from the international community. This es­
say is intended to elaborate on the abbreviated text found in the exhibition materi­
als which are reproduced in this catalogue.

This Exhibition
The exhibition material is organized in three broad areas:
- The Challenge: A heritage at risk
- The Response: Pragmatism and vision
- Partnerships for action: A coalition of the caring

The Challenge: A heritage at risk
Inevitably, development means change, and not all that is old must be preserved.
Far from it. But there are many parts of the old that can be adaptively reused, and
we must refashion the past to suit the present. This enormous challenge is worked
out in practically every arena: literature, visual art, music, buildings, customs, ritual
and the objects of everyday use. Each society must find its own solutions, where
the creative diversity of its people is linked with the universals of a common hu­
manity and inclusion for the poor, the weak and the marginalized. Women, so fre­
quently the custodians of culture and the nurturing transmitters of values to future
generations, have been too long denied the recognition of their critical, creative,
and positive contributions in shaping the cultures of the world. Their empowerment
is an enormous force for the positive transformation and renewal of both the cul­
tural paradigm and the development process.

In addition, natural sites are at risk from expanding cultivation that increases
pressure on land. Waters are being polluted and habitats destroyed, and with them
not only are eco-systems at risk, but also (for some) a whole way of life.

The cities of the developing world are going to treble in population over the next
30 years. Population growth, influx of rural migrants, and an evolving economic
base all challenge the ability of these poor and overcrowded cities to provide jobs
and livelihoods. Crumbling infrastructure, poor and over-stretched social services,
rampant real estate speculation, and weak governments all contribute to putting
tremendous pressure on the central cities, often loci of invaluable architectural and
urbanistic heritage. The degradation of the urban environment limits the abilities
of a growing, shifting homeless population to take root and establish communities
with a minimum standard of decent housing. The animosities between groups rise
and tensions within the cities fray the social fabric as much as economic specula­
tion transforms the urban tissue. The inner historic cities are increasingly ghet­
toized, with the middle-class and economic activities either fleeing the historic core
or actively destroying its very fabric.

The Response: Pragmatism and vision
Against this spiral of mounting problems, a response is possible. To protect the nat­
ural heritage through the pursuit of suitable sustainable development policies is a
matter of promoting the best practices of the few so that they become the common
practice of the many. To protect the urban context and sense of place and to revi­
talize the old city are critical if the whole city is to be kept alive, its economic base
rejuvenated, and its links to the surrounding modern city reinforced. To celebrate
the present and invent the future can also be done while conserving the past. Such
actions are possible; they require a combination of pragmatism and vision.

In essence, this response is about:

- honoring the past,
- celebrating the present, and
- designing the future.

We would thus expect to see in the responses represented in this catalogue projects that protect the natural heritage and conserve and reuse the built heritage, as well as projects that recognize and support the living expressions of culture today, what could be termed the heritage of tomorrow in the making. In many, sometimes explicitly, frequently implicitly, we find interventions that promote and celebrate community solidarity and actions for reducing poverty and improving well-being.

**Partnerships for action: A coalition of the caring**

The World Bank has been working closely as one member of an informal alliance for culture that includes UNESCO, Getty, ICCROM, Smithsonian, OAS, IDB, WMF, AKTC, Council of Europe, and many more to forge this reinforced network that would promote best practice and assist in ensuring complementarity in action. Examples of the individual efforts of these various partners are represented in the material in the exhibition, and apologies are inevitably due that space constraints make it impossible to do justice to the full range of the contributions being made by each of these institutions, not to mention many other outstanding institutions who are not represented in this exhibition.

**The World Bank and Culture**

The World Bank was one of the first institutions to adopt formal policies on indigenous people and on cultural heritage issues, but these were of the “do no harm” variety. The early efforts that dealt with historic cultural heritage in a proactive way, such as those supporting the urban projects of Lahore City in Pakistan or the Hafia District of Tunis, were few. They depended more on the commitment of specific individuals than a concerted institutional effort to be proactive on culture and development issues. More recent work on social issues—participation, empowerment and social capital—has highlighted the need to revisit cultural issues with a different eye. But it was Mr. Wolfensohn’s Hong Kong speech to the Finance Ministers and Central Banks’ Governors of the world, where he singled out the challenge of inclusion as his main theme that clearly marked the way ahead for a more systemic and systematic effort by the World Bank in the area of cultural heritage in the proactive sense of promoting identity and empowerment as a conscious part of a poverty reduction strategy.

So where do we stand today?

**The position of the World Bank**

There are three areas where the Bank will be active: conceptual analyses, financial and technical support, and partnerships.

We intend to promote conceptual analyses on the contributions for cultural expression to empowerment, linking diversity with the challenge of inclusion. But we will also be putting special emphasis on the economic justification of investments in culture, recognizing its intrinsic existence value, its public goods character and the positive externalities that it brings. That is essential. Remember that in environmental economics, the valuation of environmental assets, including the intrinsic existence value of biodiversity, was a major help in getting the countries of the world to agree to the creation of the Global Environment Facility (GEF) which has just been replenished at some US$2.7 billion.
We intend to support, financially and technically in alliance with others, the protection of the cultural heritage of the past as well as the expression of local culture of today, for that will be the heritage of tomorrow. Even more important, it is the wellspring of creativity and the foundation of identity, without which we are all like amnesiacs not knowing where we go, because we do not know who we are or where we came from.

We intend to work in partnerships with each and everyone of you, in reinforced networks of the committed, so that the whole of our efforts is more than the sum of the parts.

Conceptual constructs
Conceptually, if we recognize the unique and the specific that so enriches us, we must also recognize the universal that binds us all in a common humanity.

Yet in many parts of the world, the defense of “tradition” and cultural specificity is used as a mantra to legitimate the oppression of women and the perpetuation of intolerance and obscurantism. The pretense of “authenticity” is used to vitiate the new and to stifle creativity.

So we must recognize that the claims of cultural specificity that would deprive women of their basic human rights, or mutilate them in the name of convention, should not be given sanction. No society has progressed without making a major effort at empowering its women through education and the end of discrimination.

The approach to culture that we espouse is the one that encourages diversity and creates a space of freedom in each society for the minority expression and the contrarian view, while promoting inclusion and social cohesion. It is a rich and variegated concept that we espouse, very much in keeping with the people-centered development paradigm which the Bank is continuously working on.

On the economic and financial justifications for borrowing for and investing in culture, we advocate absolute rigor in both financial and economic analyses. In the public finance realm, we should always be guided by simple but powerful principles: who pays and who benefits?

Current work drawing from environmental economics is trying to get a more refined appreciation of the costs and benefits of managing cultural assets. The costs of the loss of irreplaceable heritage and the benefits of preserving it, beyond the utilitarian commercial benefits, of say tourist revenues, are not easy to determine. Adapting a range of techniques—from hedonic pricing and travel cost methods to contingent valuation—to estimate the intangible benefits of cultural assets is one step in that direction.

This conceptual work is needed to avoid limiting the benefit stream to a fairly measurable, solid, and understandable set—tourism revenues. Indeed a benefit stream that focuses exclusively on tourist revenue not only misses the intrinsic value of the heritage, it could lead to three erroneous conclusions that are imbedded in the logic of such an analysis:

- That those areas of the cultural heritage where one could not generate a sufficiently large tourist stream are not worth investing in. This is a denial of the intrinsic worth of the cultural heritage, both for the people there and for the enrichment that it brings to the world at large by its very existence. After all, many of us will not visit any of the sites on the World Heritage List, but we would feel impoverished to know of the loss of such sites, and feel enriched by their continued existence, even if we never visit them.

- That maximization of the number of tourists visiting the place and the amount that they spend would be desirable, since it increases the benefit stream. In fact in
many cases such a development would destroy the charm of the place and denature the activities that are endogenous to the cultural setting.

- That if another and mutually exclusive investment—say a casino on the beach—resulted in increased tourist dollars for the country, we should leave the cultural heritage site without restoration and build the casino.

Clearly, all these conclusions are neither justified nor defensible. We must look for the intrinsic value of the cultural heritage above and beyond what it is likely to generate in terms of tourist dollars. That is an area where much current work is being done.

In addition, the issue of investing in culture has different dimensions. We must not forget that there is an enormous growth in the culture-based industries, including the export of artistic output as well as the hosting of tourists. But can they continue to grow in a way that does not diminish or trivialize the local cultures? That is the challenge.

**Programmatic support**

Our program must take all these aspects into account, recognizing:

- the intrinsic worth of culture and not just what it generates in tourist revenues,
- the educational content of culture,
- the special case of historic cities,
- going beyond the "do no harm" posture,
- the need for a culture of participation, and
- the importance of promoting the sense of community, social inclusion and social cohesion.

This said, we at the World Bank are willing to commit to the financing of operations in culture in all countries who seek such loans and credits from us. We expect to provide no less than 20 or 30 operations in as many countries in the next two years. These will undoubtedly be small operations at first, but they will lay the foundations for more in the future. Even more, they will help bring the cultural dimensions into the mainstream of the developmental paradigm.

**The cultural partnerships**

More important than the funding or analysis that we can bring is the manner in which we commit to do it.

- Complementing our support to education, health, science, technology, telecommunications, and all the other essential investments; it is not an either/or proposition, it is both/and;
- With the full participation of all the stakeholders that must be part of the decision-making process—the international, regional, national and local governments, the private and public sectors, the civil society and the international agencies, with special attention to the role of women and the empowerment of the poor;
- Observing the cultural dimensions of the relations between communities, societies, and the world;
- Catalyzing the finance of others, notably the private sector, which today accounts for over US$250 billion of flows to developing countries, some five times the official development assistance flows; today the capital markets transact US$1.3 trillion per day, enough to buy and sell the gross national product of the United States in a week;
- Finally, and most importantly, in partnership with others.

We support partnerships that will link us all into a network of the committed, a coalition of the caring.
The Millennial Moment

As we approach the millennium, it is appropriate that we should look back and look forward. That we should celebrate our achievements and confront our shortcomings. That we should recognize our common humanity, promote a culture of peace, rejoice in our diversity, and enrich the lives of one and all by the celebration of this diversity.

We must, above all, take the occasion of that psychological milestone to encourage the world to shift the emphasis of the development paradigm. To shift it towards the implicit holistic vision that has been sketched out and is just now being more formally defined in the analytical and project work and financing arrangements underway.

It is a vision that sees development like a tree, which is nurtured in its growth by feeding its roots not by pulling on its branches. It is a vision of sustainable development that is people-centered and gender conscious, that seeks equity for all and empowerment of the weak and the vulnerable everywhere so they may be the producers of their own welfare and bounty, not the recipients of charity or aid.

It is a vision that recognizes that development must have a cultural content, and recognizes that governance and institution building and enhancing human capacities are all central parts of the development process and may in fact be the keys that undergird economic well-being.

But beyond the words, there must be action! So we must pursue our efforts on all three fronts: the conceptual and analytical work to give this vision a stronger grounding; the operational support of projects and finance; and the promotion of partnerships of the committed—our coalition of the caring. This exhibition and this catalogue are a reminder that this is the time to dedicate ourselves to these tasks, for the sake of societies that need a memory to have an identity, and for the people who need their identity to take charge of their own destinies and thus fulfill the vision of better tomorrows.

Ismail Serageldin
Vice-President, Special Programs
The World Bank
THE CHALLENGE: A HERITAGE AT RISK
Living Culture: Globalization and the Loss of Identity

The achievements of the world’s societies are at risk. Powerful forces of globalization, from trade to telecommunications, bring new economic opportunities as well as anomie. These forces also give rise to uniformity and standardization which challenge the specificities that make each individual unique and provide an exceptional sense of place in different parts of the world. Oral cultures are disappearing. Rituals are changing. Languages are dying out. The relentless onslaught of economic growth is threatening culture.

All progress requires change and transformation. Some of the past will inevitably disappear. With cultural sensitivity, it is possible however for the new to co-exist with the old, and for the new to be the agent of transformation and renewal rather than one of destruction.

We can have the benefits of globalization without its downside. We can promote well-being without abandoning our identities. We can seek progress without destroying our heritage. We can build a better future without forgetting our past. We must embrace what the World Commission on Culture and Development called “Our Creative Diversity” and protect it like we protect the natural biodiversity which is now protected through international conventions and global actions. Just as we recognize the unique and the specific that so enriches us, we must also recognize the universal that binds us all in a common humanity.
Mostar Bridge, Bosnia and Herzegovina
Dancers, Bolivia
Mosque made of mud, Djenne, Mali
Defining Priorities: The World Heritage List

As a means of protecting the cultural and natural heritage, UNESCO adopted the 1972 World Heritage Convention so as to:

- identify, protect, and preserve heritage considered to be of outstanding value to humanity;
- support the conservation efforts of States party to the Convention;
- monitor the preservation and protection of sites;
- provide emergency assistance for sites in immediate danger;
- encourage international cooperation; and
- motivate local participation in the preservation of this heritage.

The World Heritage List currently bears the names of 552 sites around the world that benefit from the protection of the Convention. Major efforts have been and continue to be made to save many of these unique sites from the pressures of erosion, pollution, and neglect, and to promote responsible cultural tourism.

Opposite, clockwise from top left:
St. Isaac’s Cathedral, St. Petersburg, Russian Federation
Rugged landscape of Tassili, Algeria
Taj Mahal, Agra, India
Cityscape, Quito, Ecuador
Below: Iguazu National Park, Argentina/Brazil
Pollution, Construction, and the Loss of World Heritage

Pollution, urban sprawl, and insensitive construction, in addition to the usual natural forces of erosion and decay are putting this unique heritage at risk. Natural and man-made disasters add to the damage and loss of the 552 sites on the World Heritage List. To underscore the magnitude and gravity of new dangers threatening this heritage, UNESCO establishes a "List of World Heritage in Danger." Sites on this list require major operations to ensure their conservation and transmission to future generations.

Several organizations concerned with heritage also establish lists of significant properties at risk. The World Monuments Watch compiles a biennial list of the 100 most endangered cultural landmarks around the world.

Failure to safeguard the world's cultural heritage will impoverish humankind as a whole. Good intentions must be translated into action now.
Old City Harbor, Dubrovnick, Croatia

Flooded Venice, Italy
THE RESPONSE:
PRAGMATISM AND VISION
Cultural Heritage Continuity and Renewal

To respond to these many challenges, international, national, regional, and local institutions have worked long and hard to promote an approach to development that respects the past without stifling creativity and innovation. The main features of this response act on three areas.

Protecting the past
Conserving the most essential parts of our heritage, both built and natural, does not mean freezing things indefinitely. Conservation also embodies change and renewal.

The extraordinary natural sites can be used and enjoyed by many without destroying the ecological balance. The cities of the past must continue to live today. Adaptive reuse of old buildings, not just their physical restoration, is needed to enable cities to provide livelihoods for current and future generations.

Oral heritage and ritual which are disappearing can be recorded for future generations. The written and movable items of artistic and historic merit can be conserved by the marriage of new technologies and old-fashioned scholarship.

Celebrating the present
The producers of today’s cultural expression are the artisans of tomorrow’s heritage. Their contributions should not be minimized or dismissed. Creating a climate where they can thrive is usually the climate where entrepreneurship and economic opportunities also thrive and prosper.

Designing the future
Respect for cultural specificity in a time of globalization empowers local communities to take charge of their own destinies. It is a major part of the response needed to strengthen local actors on the global stage. We must however reject claims of cultural specificity that deprive women of their basic human rights or mutilate them in the name of convention. The progress of society will inevitably be constrained without making a major effort at empowering its women, through education and the end of discrimination.

Each nation, within its own context and its own societal norms, should seek to encourage diversity and create a space of freedom for the minority expression and the contrarian view while promoting inclusion and social cohesion.
Street scene, Cairo, Egypt
Woman with textile, Bolivia
Mother and child in Rajasthan, India
Sphinx and the Pyramids, Egypt
Mont-Saint-Michel and its Bay, France
Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe
UNESCO: A Global Commitment to Cultural Heritage and Development

The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) is entrusted with the protection, conservation, and enhancement of cultural heritage by 187 Member States.

It has more than 50 years of experience and action in implementing projects to safeguard cultural heritage around the world in cooperation with the public and private sector. It has created numerous key institutions working towards the preservation of culture and is the hub of international cooperation for the preservation of cultural heritage.

Legal Instruments

- Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, 1954 (in force in 90 States);
- Convention Against Illicit Traffic of Cultural Property, 1970 (in force in 88 States);
- World Heritage Convention, 1972 (in force in 152 States);
- World Heritage List (552 sites in 112 countries: 418 cultural, 114 natural, and 20 mixed); and

Operational Projects

- Twenty-seven international campaigns including sites in Abu Simbel, Borobudur, Venice, Haiti, Carthage, Mohenjodaro, Kathmandu, Cuba, and Gorée;
- Over 60 current operational projects for the safeguarding of cultural heritage as actively exemplified in Angkor, Taj Mahal, Dubrovnik, Paga, Beirut, Samarkand, Historic Cairo, and Mongolia;
- Emergency technical assistance;
- Revitalizing and updating traditional arts and techniques; and
- Development of cultural tourism.

Mobilization of Human, Technical and Financial Resources

- Training national and local technical specialists;
- Raising public awareness and participation in conservation efforts;
- Strengthening partnerships with other UN agencies, the private sector, foundations, nongovernmental organizations; universities, and the media; and
- Developing volunteer networks

Ankgor Wat, Cambodia
Position of the World Bank

The World Bank will be active in three areas: conceptual analyses, operations, and partnerships.

- Conceptual analyses of the contributions of cultural expression to empowerment, on linking diversity to the challenge of inclusion, and of the economic justification of investments in culture, recognizing its intrinsic existence value, its public goods character, and the positive externalities that it brings.
- Operations to provide financial and technical support, in alliance with others, for the protection of the cultural heritage both natural and built, the promotion of the local culture of today, and community action for poverty reduction. These operations would include components in conventional loans such as funding for museums and libraries in education loans or historic districts in urban loans, or free-standing operations using as appropriate “learning and innovation loans” (LILs). In addition, the World Bank Group would look to guarantees and to investments from the International Finance Corporation for tourism and other activities.
- Partnerships with all interested parties in reinforced networks of the committed, so that the whole of our efforts is more than the sum of the parts.
Old Bazaar, Cairo, Egypt
Nubian monument, Abu-Simbel, Egypt
Mount Kilimanjaro, Tanzania
Investing in Culture: the Economic and Financial Calculus

Much has been done in environmental economics to estimate the often intangible benefits of the environment, namely biodiversity. Similarly, the benefits of culture are public goods which are only partially captured by market value. For the unique sites listed on the World Heritage List, the costs of protection and conservation are local, while the benefits are global.

Going beyond the intangible, there is good reason for investing in culture. The world is increasingly witnessing the growth of culture-based industries, such as the export of artistic output and the hosting of tourists. The challenge however is to promote their growth in a way that does not diminish or trivialize local cultures.

With regard to public finance, we must strike a balance between the provision of incentives and the protection of the public interest. The principles of "user pays" and "polluter pays" must also be applied. Above all, we must maintain our concern for the poor, so that they neither suffer for the enjoyment of the rich nor be excluded from enjoying the benefits from investments, whether public or private. It is thus essential to ask of each proposal: who pays? and who benefits?

Above: Great Barrier Reef, Australia
PARTNERSHIPS FOR ACTION: A COALITION OF THE CARING
An Alliance for Culture and Development

For our sake and the sake of future generations, we must master understanding of the interactions among social, economic, environmental, and physical complexities, so that the rich legacy of the past and the cultural ferment of today remain a continuing source of joy and enrichment as they evolve into the legacy of tomorrow.

Our collective actions must take all these aspects into account, recognizing:

- intrinsic worth of culture and not just what it generates in tourist revenues,
- educational content of culture,
- special case of historic cities,
- value of going beyond the “do no harm” posture,
- need for a culture of participation, and
- importance of promoting the sense of community, social inclusion, and cohesion.

Partnerships are not limited to international actors. Primarily, they must involve the people concerned. They must ensure the full participation of all the stakeholders in the decision-making process: the international, regional, national, and local governments; the private and public sectors; the civil society; and the international agencies. Special attention must be paid to the role of women and the empowerment of the poor.

To move forward we can be encouraged by the achievements of many. So let us celebrate our alliance for action. The projects on the following pages are just a few examples from the partners and are indicative of the range of activities that we should celebrate.
UNESCO

UNESCO is the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization mandated by 187 Member States for the protection of cultural heritage. It has been working for a half century toward safeguarding the world cultural heritage. Twenty-seven international campaigns have been launched and implemented by UNESCO throughout the world. It has implemented international meetings with agendas to protect cultural heritage: the Convention on the Protection of Cultural Property in the event of armed conflict (ratified by 90 States, The Hague, 1954) and the Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property (ratified by 88 States, Paris, 1970). At the 1972 Paris Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (ratified by 153 States), UNESCO was made responsible for protection, conservation, and valorization of 552 sites registered in the World Heritage List.

Over 60 operational projects for the safeguard of cultural heritage are being implemented by UNESCO in various countries, all with the financial support of Member States and with the partnership of other United Nations Agencies, intergovernmental organizations, private companies, nongovernmental organizations, foundations, universities, and associations.

Sana’a, Yemen

A jewel of Arabian and Islamic architecture founded more than 2000 years ago, Sana’a is the capital city of Yemen. UNESCO has launched an international campaign to rehabilitate the old city and revitalize its socioeconomic. More than US$10 million in infrastructure and restoration works have been completed or are undergoing implementation. Infrastructure improvements include extensive pavement, water pipes, and sewerage work; and the upgrading of Wadi Sa’ilah. The restoration of the city wall and of individual building is underway. The financing of restoration and new construction has been undertaken with the assistance of France, Germany, Italy, Japan, the Democratic People’s Republic of Korea, the Republic of Korea, Netherlands, Norway, Switzerland, Yemen, UNDP, and UNESCO.
Island of Goree, Senegal

The Island of Goree near Dakar was used beginning in the 15th century as a marshaling station in the slave trade. Following nomination of this historic site by Senegal to the World Heritage List, UNESCO launched an international campaign for its preservation. The objective of the campaign is to rehabilitate the damages caused by weathering and corrosion and to revitalize the Island's economy by promoting it as a major tourist destination in Senegal. The multifaceted program developed for the site includes preservation of the architectural heritage, and sociocultural revival through the development of schools and handicrafts units. In addition, the program will promote economic development by fostering the start-up of small private enterprises and the development of tourist facilities including information centers, hotels, and restaurants. Finally, the program aims to improve basic services including water, sewerage, garbage collection and health; and to safeguard the natural environment.

Achievements to date include the conservation and reuse of the architectural heritage: the Slave House as a museum, the d'Estere Fort as a museum and cultural center, the Victoria Albis House, and the Sudan House. Restoration and adaptive reuse projects, planned or under implementation, include the Relais de l'Espadon and the ancient military hospital, both of which will become hotels funded by private investors from the United States; the restoration of the ancient William-Ponty school and another building as a hotel and training center; and the restoration of the Hortala House and the Diouga-Dieng House. A partnership in technical cooperation and funding has been established by UNESCO, France, Germany, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Ford Foundation, Order of Malta, and private donors.

Kathmandu Valley, Nepal

Kathmandu Valley covers an area of 570 square miles and rises to an altitude of 1,200 to 1,500 meters. Located at the center of Nepal, the area has for centuries been the seat of successive dynasties and still boasts their rich legacy of palaces, temples and monasteries. UNESCO has launched an international campaign to safeguard and restore a total of 132 structures in the Kathmandu Valley including Durbar Square in Kathmandu, Durbar Square in Patan, Durbar Square in Bhadgaon (Bhaktapur), Pashupati, Changu Narayan, and Swayambhu.

Patan Durbar Square is at the center of this international campaign. Mostly built during the reigns of Siddhi Narasingha Malla and Shrinivasa Malla, the 17th century Palace contains Degu Talle, the largest temple in the Valley; Taleju Mandir Temple; Mul Chowk, and Sundari Chowk. These structures are all in urgent need of structural repairs to prevent their further deterioration. The principal donors are UNESCO, UNDP, World Heritage Fund, Japan, and Germany.
Istanbul, Turkey

UNESCO has launched a two-phased, US$3 million campaign to safeguard the historic quarters and monuments of Istanbul. The first phase action plan includes restoration of the city walls and the rehabilitation of the surrounding areas; rehabilitation of the Suleymaniye historic district; maintenance and repair of the Topkapi Palace and Hagia Sophia; and restoration of parts of Yildiz Palace. The second phase will include the restoration of the Zeyrek Mosque and its surrounding neighborhood, the Valens Aqueduct, and the Golden Horn area.

Goreme, Turkey

The site of Goreme in the Cappadocia region contains a unique geological formation with chimney-like towering cones. Some of these slender peaks of hard rock were hollowed out during the Byzantine period and used as churches, frequently decorated with murals. They have become fragile as a result of erosion and fissure. Some of the church mural paintings have been vandalized. UNESCO has launched an international campaign to safeguard the site.

Turkish authorities have established a Cappadocia Regional Conservation Plan for the Churches Valley of Goreme and other culturally significant sites including caravansaries, underground settlements of Kaymak, Ozkonak, and Tatlarin, as well as the abandoned towns in the two Zelve valley canyons. The towns of Avanos, Urgup, and Ortahisar are also included. Traditional houses are being restored and reused as inns, restaurants, artists' colonies, and other appropriate functions. Design guidelines for restoration and new construction were adopted, specifying height limits, materials, and key architectural features. In partnership, UNDP, UNESCO, and ICOMOS provide technical and financial assistance. Projects under implementation include:

- consolidation of rock-hewn churches of the Goreme Valley (US$155,000 per church)
- conservation of mural paintings (US$75,000),
- restoration of caravansaries (US$200,000 per caravansary),
- conservation of underground settlements and of natural environment, and
- improvement of tourist services in region.

The Guaranis of Argentina, Brazil, and Paraguay

UNESCO has provided assistance to Argentina, Brazil, and Paraguay to protect sites constructed by the Guaranis Indians and the Order of Jesuits. Some 30 villages were built between 1609 to 1801 to specialize in breeding livestock, indigenous agriculture, and handicrafts. The stone buildings and the sculpture and painting that adorn them are now in ruins. Restoration projects are being implemented with the help of UNESCO and the International Campaign to Safeguard the Heritage of the Jesuit Missions of the Guaranis. Project goals include creating a tourist road linking the sites; restoring what remains of the major buildings; and improving the daily lives of the people living around and near the sites.
The Getty Conservation Institute

The Getty Conservation Institute works internationally to further the appreciation and preservation of the world’s cultural heritage for the enrichment and use of present and future generations. The Institute is part of the J. Paul Getty Trust, a private operating foundation dedicated to the visual arts that provides opportunities for people to more fully understand, experience, value, and preserve humanity’s artistic and cultural heritage.

The Maya Initiative: A preservation/development link

From circa 200–900 AD, the Maya formed the most advanced pre-Columbian civilization in the New World, inhabiting about 40 cities that today lie in Mexico, Belize, Guatemala, Honduras, and El Salvador.

With the Maya’s mysterious decline after circa 900 AD, these magnificent cities of stone and clay became deserted and overgrown with tropical jungle. Decay, looting, and vandalism followed, leaving a monumental but fragile legacy that is yet to be fully discovered, understood, and hopefully preserved.

Spearheaded by the Getty Conservation Institute, the five Maya countries have signed agreements to collaborate on developing a sustainable cultural heritage management plan that includes:

- conservation plans for the Maya region including training and education in heritage preservation and pilot projects in Honduras, El Salvador, and Guatemala;
- parallel development of the infrastructure and heritage tourism, leading to new jobs in construction, utilities, transportation, communications, trade, banks, entertainment, restaurants, hotels, and other areas; and
- community involvement by applying the local skills, crafts, and traditions to the design and implementation of projects.

It is hoped that the success of this collaboration will attract outside funders to the area by creating a model project for similar efforts around the world.
The Bas-Reliefs of Benin, West Africa, History Told on Walls

The walls of the royal palaces of Abomey, a World Heritage Site in Benin, West Africa, are pages in an illustrated history of the Fon people. The country was formerly known as the Kingdom of Dahomey, a prosperous center of culture and trade that reached its peak in the 16th and 17th centuries, fell to the French in the 19th, and regained independence in the 20th.

In a joint effort with Benin, the Getty Conservation Institute has now completed work on the heavily damaged bas-reliefs of the Salle des Bijoux. Now on display at the Historical Museum of Abomey, they are a source of pride, inspiration, and information alike for residents, tourists, researchers, teachers, students, and storytellers.

The Footprints of Humanity, Laetoli

Human beings emerged feet first! The proof lies in a 3.6 million year-old trackway in Laetoli, northern Tanzania, that bears the earliest impressions on Earth of hominids (human-like creatures) walking upright. It took our ancestors another million years to use their heads to make tools!

The footprints were discovered and documented by Mary Leakey in 1979, then reburied to protect them from wildlife and the elements. Over time acacia trees and other dangerous growth led to a Getty Conservation Institute and Tanzania preservation project that involved the training of local conservators and Maasai tribesmen. The general public can now visit the site through a new bilingual English/Swahili exhibition at nearby Olduvai Museum.
The Mogao Grottoes, People's Republic of China Art en Route

Located along the gateway to China on the Silk Route, the mile-long Mogao grottoes house some of the world's richest collections of Buddhist art with over 2,400 sculptures and 45,000 square-meters of murals dating from the 4th to the 14th centuries. The Getty Conservation Institute, the State Bureau of Cultural Relics, and the Dunhuang Academy have worked together since 1989 to preserve this World Heritage Site.

The local economy is now the fastest growing in the province due to increased tourism drawn to Mogao. Good conservation and management practices developed as an outcome of this project will ensure the stability of this irreplaceable heritage and therefore of sustainable tourism.

Nefertari, Valley of the Queens, Luxor, Egypt Art and Eternity

When Nefertari, the favorite queen of Rameses the Great, died circa 3,200 years ago at age 40, she was buried in a tomb adorned with wall paintings believed to have the power to pave her path to resurrection. Thirty-two hundred years later, the magic has proven right and the art has made Nefertari eternal. It took an international team of experts six years (1986–92) in a joint project with the Getty Conservation Institute and the Egyptian Antiquities Organization project to stabilize the heavily-damaged wall paintings. Now the favorite destination in the Valley of the Queens, the project is a leading example of interdisciplinary cooperation in saving a World Heritage Site from destruction and rendering it safe for heritage-friendly tourism.
Established in 1949, the Council of Europe has 47 Member States and is headquartered in Strasbourg, France. Cultural heritage is an important aspect of the Council's basic mission to foster freedom, human rights, and the rule of law. It is also a pillar of the sustainable development model promoted by the Council for balanced economic regeneration and environmental conservation in Europe. The Council's aim in the field of cultural heritage is to promote co-operation among the 47 States adhering to the European cultural convention, elaborate new heritage policies, and provide technical assistance.

In accordance with the terms of the Granada and Malta Convention, the Technical Cooperation and Consultancy Program, established by the Committee Ministers in 1973, responds to requests from Member States for assistance in cultural heritage conservation. To date, over 55 projects have been completed in 25 Western and Eastern European countries with the participation of more than 320 expert consultants. In 1997 projects are being implemented in Albania, Belarus, Croatia, Czech Republic, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Georgia, Latvia, Malta, Portugal, the Russian Federation, and Slovenia.

**Action Plan for Bosnia and Herzegovina**

Two major challenges face Bosnia and Herzegovina following the recent civil conflict which devastated both basic infrastructure and historic sites. One is managing the reconstruction and development process; the second is establishing the administrative and legal structures consistent with the country's recent independence.

Various projects were identified following the Helsinki Appeal of May 30–31, 1996, during the 4th European Conference of Ministers responsible for cultural heritage. They are being implemented in accordance with a comprehensive action plan that brings together the government's heritage policy with the views of the community on priorities for revitalizing their environment. Specific projects include urban renewal, incorporating returning refugees into subsidized housing, community participation in civil society, and public education. It is important that preservation of cultural heritage receives priority attention, given the need to create a peaceful future.

In collaboration with the European Union and with support of the Government of Norway and the Flemish Region of Belgium, a preliminary phase is under way to suggest specific areas for interventions. Possible bilateral partnerships are under discussion with the World Bank and with European governments to implement these actions.
Pilot Project for Tbilisi
The project aims to delineate the urban management tools needed for the rehabilitation of the historic district of Tbilisi, the capital city of Georgia and define a housing development strategy. It is being implemented as part of the Specific Action Plan for the country. Partially completed initial steps include surveys defining priority values and determining the economic potential of the area.

An important housing priority is the minimum dislocation of the poor in areas targeted for renewal. This requires a significant effort to improve living conditions and to involve the inhabitants in the planning process. Considering the lack of resources, external funding is necessary to initiate the renewal process.

A program of coordinated technical cooperation is underway involving the Council of Europe, the Government of Georgia, and the World Bank. This cooperation can pave the way for direct investment in the revitalization of Tbilisi’s historic district.

Rostov Veliky
Peter the Great built Rostov Veliky on the border of Lake Nero, close to the Volga River. Its 18th century radial plan, clay fortifications, and important monasteries give it a spiritual and significant place in the history of Russia. It has changed little since its economic decline in the 19th century and still retains its old fabric and wooden structures. The rising level of the lake and the ground water table now threaten its fragile structure. If the situation does not abate, the city may disappear within two or three decades. The restoration of Rostov Veliky, as part of the Golden Ring of historic cities surrounding Moscow, became of interest in the 1990s.

The Council of Europe made a preliminary diagnosis of the environmental, social, and conservation issues. In 1997 stakeholders convened to discuss prospects for stabilizing and conserving the ancient city. The plan presented to the Federation’s presidency identified priorities to safeguard the city, promote its socio-economic development, and proposed concerted actions involving local, regional, and federal actors.

Pilot Project for the Abava Valley
The protected territory of the Abava Valley in Latvia covers 120 square kilometers and includes natural landscapes and ancient human settlements. Launched in 1994 under the auspices of the Council of Europe, the project has created a sustainable development strategy designed to enable local authorities to conserve the Valley’s cultural heritage while improving general living conditions. This process involved ensuring legal protection, providing technical cooperation for local authorities and educating the Valley’s inhabitants.

Scarce resources precluded offering financial incentives to the local population. Nevertheless the people understood their responsibilities for maintaining the environmental and historic character of their surroundings. Numerous projects demonstrating the improving climate have been proposed to the special administration responsible for coordinating the project.

Management Plan for Telc
Telc, a town of 6,000 inhabitants in the Czech Republic, became a World Heritage Site in 1992. The town’s citizens face the challenge of maintaining and managing their historic town in a period of national political, social, and economic transition. At the request of local authorities, the Council of Europe is providing support to this small community for the preservation of a rich and internationally acknowledged heritage.

Council of Europe experts have worked with the community since 1994 to create a management plan, a tourism strategy, and a monitoring process. A significant aspect is the Co-ordination Center comprised of citizens and specially trained young people who manage the work. This Center stimulates dialogue and public awareness among residents of Telc and other small communities in the vicinity of the town.
Dedicated to the increase and diffusion of knowledge by furthering the understanding and interpretation of the past, the Smithsonian Institution is the world's largest complex of museums and art galleries. Its holdings in the arts, sciences, and history total more than 137 million objects and specimens. It is a major center of basic and scholarly research. Its resources are made available for education and research from the elementary to the post-graduate level.

Cape Coast, Ghana, Heritage under Threat

Throughout the 1990s a US-based consortium, including the Smithsonian Institution's Office of International Relations, has assisted the Ghanaian government's effort to refurbish old coastal fortresses and put these World Heritage Sites to use as active museums. Elmina (the Mine), built by Portuguese gold seekers in 1482, is the oldest European structure south of the Sahara. Six miles away stands the imposing Cape Coast Castle which was built by the Swedes in 1653 and later served as a British Gold Coast headquarters.

In 1991 USAID awarded US$5.6 million to a group of nongovernmental organizations spearheaded by the Midwestern Universities Consortium for International Activities. Dilapidated fortress buildings were stabilized and repaired using traditional materials supplemented by modern applications. The Ghana Museums and Monuments Board refurbished the interiors, installed modern services, and identified uses and presentations for visitors. The Smithsonian Institution assisted onsite interpretation that allowed Ghanaian scholars to prepare two major exhibitions: "Crossroads of People, Crossroads of Trade in the Cape Coast Castle Museum" and "Images of Elmina Across the Centuries at Elmina Castle."

Investment in these two buildings has led to further museum work presenting Ghanaian history to national and international audiences. The museums project has stimulated tourism development in the region, leveraging an additional US$75 million of public and private investment in infrastructure and facilities and creating thousands of permanent jobs for the local community.
Proposed Restoration of Spanish Town Historic Core, Jamaica

Originally built on a Taino settlement site, Spanish Town was Jamaica’s capital under Spanish and English rule from 1534 to 1872. Its 18th century Georgian square, erected on the site of the Spanish plaza major, is an architectural marvel and the location where the Jamaican Declaration of the Abolition of Slavery was promulgated in 1838.

Since the 1940s, the importance of Spanish Town as a physical artifact and symbol of the traditions of colonial Jamaica has led to proposals for the adaptive reuse of its historic core. In the 1980s a UNESCO study identified its potential as a cultural and tourism center. The National Heritage Trust has since upgraded a Folk Museum and moved to have the historic core declared a World Heritage Site.

An Historic District Preservation Committee has been established for the restoration of the physical integrity of the renamed Emancipation Square. The Smithsonian Institution and the Getty Conservation Institute have been asked to assist with the conservation and adaptive reuse of two of these buildings as museums and with preventive measures for conservation of collections within them. The area is to be developed as a heritage tourism center with great economic benefit to the local community. A lending and grant package will fund its restoration and maintenance and the development of a complex of well-managed and designed museums to catalyze social education and community action.

The Smithsonian Folklife Festival and Cultural Development

The Smithsonian Center for Folklife Programs & Cultural Studies promotes the understanding and continuity of diverse contemporary grassroots cultures in the United States and throughout the world. The Center produces the annual Smithsonian Folklife Festival, Smithsonian Folkways Recordings, traveling exhibitions, documentary films, and educational materials.

The Center’s philosophy joins scholarship with community service and educational outreach to affect policies and practice at the local, national, and international levels. Center products have been recognized with Academy, Emmy, and Grammy Awards. The Festival programs take shape from hundreds of projects organized in cooperation with ministries and institutions in more than 70 countries.

Indonesia was featured at the 1991 Folklife Festival. The program was the result of an intensive research effort that produced a series of 20 CDs of local music of the archipelago. These were recorded on the Smithsonian Folkways record label and received support from the Ford Foundation. The project included training of Indonesian ethnomusicologists and the production of extensive notes in English and Bahasa Indonesia for the recordings.

The culture of the United States-Mexico Borderlands was featured in the 1993 Festival. Community-based research produced archival material from which a Smithsonian Folkways record and educational kit was developed and distributed in schools throughout the border region.
In its cultural heritage mission, the Aga Khan Trust for Culture (AKTC) conducts three major programs: the Aga Khan Award for Architecture, the Historic Cities Support Programme, and the Education and Culture Programme. All address the Trust’s primary purpose to improve the built environment in societies where Muslims have a significant presence. They do so in distinct ways and have different geographical coverage and audiences.

To underwrite the vitality and integrity of built environments in the Muslim world, enhance the quality of life, foster self-understanding and community values, and expand opportunities for economic and social development into the future, the Aga Khan Trust for Culture has developed programs that support:

- pursuits of excellence in contemporary architecture and related fields;
- conservation and creative reuse of historic buildings and public spaces that facilitate social, economic, and cultural development;
- strengthening of education in architecture practice, planning, and conservation; and
- international exchange of ideas to enhance understanding of the intimate connection between culture and built environments in the history and culture of Islamic civilizations and contemporary Muslim societies.

The Karimabad/Baltit Project in Hunza, Pakistan

The work initiated in Karimabad is a key endeavor of the Aga Khan Trust for Culture with regard to community participation and demonstrates future AKTC intentions in this domain. The Trust’s involvement started with the restoration of the Baltit Fort, an important historic building nestled in a formerly secluded valley of the Karakorum Mountain Range in Northern Pakistan. A community-based planning and rehabilitation effort continues the restoration and upgrading work in Karimabad, the village located beneath the Fort.

Sustainable environmental land-use strategies are being promoted through local village organizations and a recently established nongovernmental Town Management Society. The Fort is used as a museum and cultural center, serving both residents and visitors. It has enhanced the tourism potential of the area which benefits from a spectacular natural setting formed by cultivated terraces, rock slopes, and the peaks of Karakorum Range. Preserving this setting, while enabling the residents to benefit from emerging economic development opportunities, is the central theme of the project’s ongoing planning process.

Grameen Bank Housing Program

In 1989 the Aga Khan Award for Architecture recognized the merit of the outstanding housing loan program initiated by the Grameen Bank. Since 1976 the Grameen Bank has provided small loans to the most disadvantaged sections of the rural community in Bangladesh in order to raise their standard of living by providing access to credit. Started in 1984 as an extension of this policy, the Grameen Bank housing loan program provides bank members, mostly women, with between US$250 and US$600 to build a new house. The Grameen Bank requires that the roof be covered with corrugated iron sheeting and supported by reinforced concrete columns, which are manufactured by the Bank, in order to provide a flood resistant and waterproof structure.

Repayment of the housing loan is made possible by the increase in household revenue generated through access to earlier loans. As of May 1998 over 438,000 houses have been built. The interest bearing loans are repaid with a zero default rate.
Planning for the Historic City of Samarkand, Uzbekistan

Monte nous change is taking place in the Central Asian Republics of the former Soviet Union. The rich heritage in historic cities of this region poses major challenges in terms of appropriate conservation policies, economic revitalization, and viable institutional structures.

Launched in early 1995, this AKTC Historic Cities Support Program project aims to contribute solutions to these emerging transition problems by focusing on the historic nucleus of Samarkand. The initiative of the Historic Cities Support Program is to assist the municipality by establishing an appropriate urban management system for the revitalization and rehabilitation of the city’s historic districts. Young Uzbek professionals are being exposed to current international standards of practice to allow them to safeguard their cultural heritage.

The Old Stone Town Project in Zanzibar

In the context of a general master planning effort, the Trust has assisted the Ministry of Construction, Water, Energy, Lands, and the Environment in the formulation of a comprehensive conservation and development plan for the historic Stone Town.

To promote revitalization of individual buildings of historic importance, the Trust’s local service company (Aga Khan Cultural Services-Zanzibar) entered into a lease agreement with the Zanzibar authorities at a time when virtually all land was owned by the government. This company assisted the Trust in restoring the Old Dispensary building and will operate and maintain it (as the Stone Town Cultural Center) with income generated through its reuse.

The Trust has also issued a site grant to Tourism Promotion Services (Zanzibar), an affiliate of the Aga Khan Fund for Economic Development, to convert the abandoned Extelcom building into a 52-room hotel. Located on the Zanzibar sea front, its revitalization is part of a more ambitious program to improve public open spaces, such as the Kelele Square which is being undertaken by the Trust.
Concerned individuals witnessing the accelerated destruction of important artistic treasures throughout the world founded the World Monuments Fund (WMF) as a private nonprofit organization in 1965. To date WMF has participated in more than 165 major projects in 52 countries. Today with affiliates established in Britain, France, Italy, Portugal, and Spain, WMF sponsors an ongoing worldwide program for the conservation of cultural heritage. Currently, WMF is involved with 62 projects in 46 countries. The World Monuments Watch, launched in 1995 on the occasion of the Fund’s thirtieth anniversary, aims to enhance the organization’s unique capacity to identify imperiled cultural heritage sites and leverage financial and technical support for their preservation.

The Angkor Challenge

The World Monuments Fund surveyed Angkor in 1989 to evaluate damage to the site following 20 years of civil strife and isolation. Although the temples at Angkor were relatively unaffected, only a handful of conservation workers had survived the upheavals that shook the country.

To preserve Angkor, Cambodia’s most cherished symbol of its cultural identity and its touchstone to the past, WMF approaches the task by providing employment opportunities and the necessary skills to the local population. The objectives of WMF are to undertake above-ground archaeological research at Angkor to expand knowledge of the ancient Khmer Empire and Angkor’s prehistory, and establish conservation methodologies appropriate for Khmer monuments. In addition WMF will recommend means of protecting and properly presenting the historic monuments and their environs; emphasize formal on-site conservation training for architecture students and local craftsmen; and ensure the protection of Angkor’s movable cultural property by using video imaging and site-specific computerized inventories to document the architectural sculpture at Preah Khan to deter theft and vandalism.

At the request of the Cambodian government, WMF is conducting a pilot project to reconstitute a comprehensive conservation effort for the site and restore to its Cambodian custodians the skills needed for its care and management. A site survey of Preah Khan, a 12th-century temple city, led WMF to construct a long-term program for repairing and conserving the site as a partial ruin. Major reconstruction was deemed inappropriate due to the lack of historical data, the magnitude of the task, and the questionable philosophical nature of such an approach.
List of 100 Most Endangered Sites
The World Monuments Watch identifies cultural landmarks worldwide that are in need of immediate rescue. After a biennial review of site nominations by a panel of prominent international experts, WMF announces the List of 100 Most Endangered Sites, a public appeal for help in addressing contemporary threats to cultural heritage. The World Monuments Watch provides annual grants in support of projects to save selected sites on the list. American Express Company, which has committed US$5 million to the World Monuments Watch over its first five years, is the founding sponsor of the program. Many other corporations, foundations, and individual donors also have provided grants. Over US$5 million in grants to help save 77 sites in 43 countries has been raised by WMF.
Effective conservation of cultural heritage resources worldwide is the mandate of the International Center for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM). Founded by UNESCO in 1956, ICCROM has been located in Rome since 1959 and currently has 94 Member States and 94 Associate Members. As a unique intergovernmental organization dealing with all types of movable and immovable heritage, ICCROM takes a practical and holistic approach to its task of creating or improving conditions for effective conservation. Heritage conservation can foster a strong sense of cultural identity essential for development and social stability. Close links with ICCROM to the United Nations family are in line with the ultimate goal of promoting world peace.

PREMA 1990-2000: Prevention in Museums in Africa
Since 1986, PREMA has been safeguarding and promoting Africa’s cultural heritage as a key to sustainable development. PREMA is an active network of some 400 museum workers from 46 sub-Saharan countries. They exchange experience on ways to upgrade the condition of collections and increase public involvement. PREMA has reached a broad African public through 12 temporary exhibitions, ongoing television and radio awareness campaigns, and hundreds of articles in the African press. PREMA has delivered eight international university courses on the conservation and use of collections, courses in eight national museums, special workshops and seminars for museum directors in eight countries, and six newsletters and a database of African museum professionals. PREMA technical solutions include construction of a 200 square-meter storage building, inventories of eleven national collections, refurbishing more than ten museum storage areas, and pest elimination and control in two national collections. In addition, PREMA has given grants and equipment to support over 100 small museum improvement projects.

PREMA has served the African future by increasing the percentage of African teachers in its programs from 5 percent in 1986 to 80 percent in 1997.
“Stop Graffiti Vandalism”

The office of the Mayor of Rome and the Istituto Centrale del Restauro have collaborated with ICCROM on a campaign to address civic damage resulting from graffiti. An intensive three-month educational sequence focused on 6- to 18-year old students with outreach to the broader public. The use of booklets for classroom teaching and of specially prepared slide lectures built community awareness on the destructive effects of spray paint on the porous materials in Rome’s monuments and on the cost plus the difficulty of cleaning defaced sites. A poster design competition was held among the students to encourage the practice of conservation. Mayor Rutelli awarded prizes in a ceremony that received extensive media coverage, sending a strong student message to their peers. Selections of the best posters will be posted widely and displayed in a large center city exhibition.

Pan-American Conservation and Management of Earthen Architecture and Archaeology (PAT)

Held in Trujillo, Peru, the PAT96 Course was attended by 24 architects, archaeologists, conservators, and site managers from Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Colombia, Cuba, Ecuador, El Salvador, Peru, Uruguay, the United States, and Venezuela.

The course was designed to promote a methodological, scientific, and interdisciplinary approach to the conservation and management of the earthen architectural heritage; and the development and execution of management plans befitting the special characteristics of this heritage. In addition, the course included a component for institutional awareness regarding the study, conservation, and management of earthen architectural structures.

PAT96 coincided with the tenth anniversary of the inscription of Chan Chan on the World Heritage List. As a result, a number of ancillary activities took place, including an “Abrazo de Chan Chan,” during which 17,000 schoolchildren from the Trujillo area encircled the site hand-in-hand, drawing national attention to the need to care for this important treasure.

ICCROM partners included the Instituto Nacional de Cultura de Peru; the Instituto Nacional de Cultura, Direccion Regional de La Libertad, Trujillo; the International Centre for Earth Construction; and the Getty Conservation Institute. PAT96 was supported by contributions from the European Union, DGIB, and the World Heritage Fund of UNESCO.
Organization of American States

As the world's oldest regional organization, the Organization of American States (OAS) includes 35 Member States and 43 observers, a status granted also to the European Union. Its purpose is to support the welfare of its members through economic, social, and cultural development. The Organization of American States sees culture as a fundamental and integral component of development in the Americas. It has the capacity to enrich peoples and generate greater understanding among them. The OAS has defined four strategic actions for the period 1998 to 2001:

- promoting respect for cultural diversity,
- disseminating and protecting cultural heritage,
- developing human resources and encouraging creativity, and
- promoting cultural tourism.

Natural Dyes: Supporting Culturally Based Enterprises

The discovery of aniline dyes in 1853 caused natural dyes to fall from favor. Synthesized colors were less expensive but proved harmful to the earth and its waters. A growing ecological awareness among consumers and manufacturers has sparked the revival of natural dyes. Traditional peoples of Latin America and Asia who preserved the science and art of tinting are major producers of dye plants and natural dyes. The ecological and economic benefits are twofold: small farmers have a cash crop and dye plants improve the environment.

The Organization of American States, in partnership with Aid to Artisans, a US-based non-profit organization, has a pilot project to assess strengths and needs of crafts organizations in five countries: Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, and Nicaragua. Training will be offered to one craft leader from each country to increase market access and employment opportunities. An expanded project will create a regional organization to strengthen artisans in Central America through product development, business training, and crafts marketing.

Youth Symphony

The OAS has sponsored the multilateral project on Children's and Youth Symphony Orchestras of the Americas since 1978. The project is founded on the operational method designed by the Venezuelan national children's and youth orchestras. Currently, Venezuela has 55 such orchestras incorporating close to 110,000 children and adolescents into its programs. The Venezuelan method has been applied throughout the countries of the Hemisphere. The objective of the project is to attain a hemispheric-wide network of children's and youth orchestras to inspire music appreciation among the young, promote social development and community spirit, and offer artistic and intellectual opportunities that would normally not be affordable. Both the Inter-American Development Bank and UNESCO contribute to this project.
Historical Monuments and Sites of the Greater Caribbean

The Greater Caribbean Plan for Monuments and Sites (CARIMOS), supported by the OAS for more than a decade, identifies, researches, and preserves historic structures in Caribbean countries. Its Caribbean Preservation Institute, affiliated with the University of Florida at Gainesville, conducts training in cooperation with other universities in the Caribbean basin. A research and publication program complements technical assistance on mapping, inventorying, restoration, and preservation of structures, as well as conservation of objects. Exhibitions in member countries promote knowledge of the region’s cultural heritage.

Member States of the OAS are Antigua and Barbuda, Argentina, Bahamas (Commonwealth of), Barbados, Belize, Bolivia, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Cuba, Dominica (Commonwealth of), Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Grenada, Guatemala, Guyana, Haiti, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Paraguay, Peru, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, Suriname, Trinidad and Tobago, United States, Uruguay and Venezuela.
Inter-American Development Bank

Created in 1959 by the United States and 19 Latin American and Caribbean countries, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) works to stimulate economic and social development in the region. Membership in IDB now includes 28 countries in the Western Hemisphere and 18 outside the region, making it the largest as well as the oldest regional multilateral development institution. It was the first such institution to lend for social projects such as water, sanitation, health, and education. Annual IDB lending averages between US$6 billion and US$7 billion. Total investment in projects financed by the IDB is estimated at more than US$220 billion.

Cultural Heritage and Conservation

The IDB supports projects that promote a more rational allocation of public resources devoted to the conservation of the cultural heritage through the involvement of private capital and managerial capacity. It aims to increase the impact of scarce public resources and foster sustainable development. Its urban heritage activities focus on the promotion of conservation through regulations and incentives, the use of urban heritage conservation as a catalyst for urban revitalization, and the conservation of historic areas with private sector participation.

New Life for Colonial Quito

The IDB is assisting the city of Quito to rehabilitate and preserve its historic center, a UNESCO World Heritage Site. The program seeks to conserve one of the richest historic areas in Latin America with private sector participation. A loan of US$41 million will help restore the city center’s functional importance and bring back commerce, residents, and services to the area. Public improvements will attract private real estate investment for the restoration of historic buildings. The program also provides working capital to the Empresa del Centro Histórico de Quito, a mixed-capital enterprise owned by the municipality and private investors that undertakes joint ventures with landowners to restore buildings of strategic importance. The program will demonstrate that such ventures are viable, creating a climate that will attract additional private investment.
Quito's Colonial Art School

Quito’s Taller Escuela Bernardo de Legarda art school is one of only six schools in Latin America teaching students colonial art restoration techniques. Funds from IDB channeled through an Ecuadorian nonprofit organization helped the school purchase tools and expand its operations. “Quito art is one of the treasures of our culture,” says the school’s director, Nicolás Jiménez. “It is part of our identity.”

Bilingual Education in Bolivia

For the first time, thousands of indigenous children in Bolivia are being taught how to read and write both Spanish and their native languages — Aymara and Quechua — something their parents cannot do. The IDB-financed innovation is part of a sweeping education reform program underway in the Andean country. Included in the program are new textbooks with drawings that show children and adults dressed in indigenous clothing and girls with boys in situations of equality.

Brazil’s Capivara Cave Paintings

Prehistoric cave paintings at 260 different sites in Capivara Park, a UNESCO World Heritage Site in northeastern Brazil, are the oldest known in the Americas. Some of them were painted 12,000 to 15,000 years ago. Commercial hunting, fires, and land clearing are destroying these sites. Archaeologists realized that a solution to the problem required improving economic conditions for local residents. In 1995 the IDB provided a grant of US$1.7 million to help preserve the sites, to provide them with health and education facilities, and to improve roads to stimulate tourism as a source of income for local residents.
The World Bank

The World Bank Group is committed to help its Member States in the reduction of poverty and the improvement of peoples lives everywhere through the promotion of environmentally and socially sustainable economic development. The Bank maintains a broad and deep relationship with all its borrowing members, that covers the gamut from policy dialogue and analytical work to technical and financial support for the design and implementation of projects and programs. The Bank recognizes that many factors enter into an effective development strategy and action program, and sees culture as an integral part of the development paradigm. Cultural identity is essential for social cohesion, inclusion and empowerment of people to take charge of their own well being. Within the framework of national identity and universal values, the World Bank seeks to celebrate diversity, the rights of women and minorities and promote equity. Thus the projects that the Bank supports honor the past, celebrate the present, and help people design their own future.

St. Petersburg Center City Rehabilitation Project
Founded in 1703 by Peter the Great, St. Petersburg was listed as a World Heritage Site in 1986. Over 8,000 buildings and landmarks are located in its historic center, which is visited by over two million tourists a year. Even though the center has retained its historic character and its cultural and economic importance, the infrastructure and historic landmarks have deteriorated due to insufficient public funds.

A recently adopted Strategic Plan aims to redefine development potentials, mobilize resources from the private and public sectors, and set priority strategic actions linked to a public investment program. A World Bank loan, approved in 1997, will finance studies for regulatory reform, capacity building, and pilot rehabilitation projects to demonstrate how infrastructure improvements can leverage the privately financed rehabilitation of historic sites. Public investment in tourist infrastructure is expected to stimulate cultural and commercial activities and improve municipal revenues.

Specific project components include the following:
- technical assistance to support strategic planning and the initiation of a center city rehabilitation program,
- pilot projects to improve the Nevsky Prospect and rehabilitate the Kapella Theatre and historical courtyards, and
- an Experimental Cultural Fund to assist federally owned cultural institutions to improve their ability to generate non-budgetary revenue.

Rehabilitation of the Medina Of Fes
The Medina is a World Heritage Site and a leading cultural and religious center in Morocco. It offers a striking contrast between commercial areas with thriving economic activity and over-densified residential quarters where buildings are steadily deteriorating.

The World Bank, working in close collaboration with UNESCO, assisted the Moroccan government to prepare a conservation and rehabilitation project for Fes. The objectives of the project are to expand and accelerate ongoing conservation efforts, to consolidate partnerships among the public and private and other donors, and to use the rehabilitation process to alleviate poverty and mitigate adverse environmental impacts.

Previous environmental studies recommended the relocation of polluting industries, the regrouping of traditional activities, and the improvement of solid waste collection. Specific actions financed by the project were based on extensive surveys of households and commercial activities, the assessments of economic and environmental impacts, and the contingent valuation of non-economic benefits of conserving the cultural heritage.

Priority actions include:
- improving the existing street and circulation networks;
- creating thematic tourist circulation routes and the restoration of monuments;
- expanding existing programs to consolidate dilapidated structures, and rehabilitating culturally significant buildings;
- alleviating poverty by creating employment opportunities through labor-intensive public works and induced private construction and commercial activities;
- providing incentives to encourage private investment in the rehabilitation;
- improving urban services and public spaces; and
- engaging residents in the improvement process.
Bolivia Indigenous People Cultural Heritage Fund
With 55 percent of the total population composed of Quechua and Ayamara Indians, Bolivia has a rich and diverse heritage. Their cultural identity is strong in spite of high levels of illiteracy and the poverty. A study supported by the World Bank and the Government of Denmark looks at new models for the participation of indigenous communities in the preservation of their culture and the safeguard of archeological sites. The study will provide the foundation for a cultural heritage development project and will have three components:
- a National Indigenous Cultural Heritage Development Strategy to help communities preserve their own local cultural heritage,
- assistance with the design and implementation of small-scale projects to help revitalize their cultural identity, and
- a capacity-building program to strengthen local organizations and provide indigenous people with the technical skills needed to manage and preserve cultural and archeological sites.

Preserving the heritage of Mali
With a 1995 estimated per capita income of US$250, contemporary Mali is one of the poorest countries in the world. More than 60 percent of its population lives below the poverty line and the incidence of poverty is particularly high in rural areas. Mali has a complex and impressive history. Its diverse people have left a rich heritage of sanctuaries, sacred places, and ritual objects. Timbuktu and Gao were prosperous centers of Islamic culture and learning.

The 1996 Urban Development and Decentralization Project approved by the World Bank combines a cultural component with programs aimed at improving urban management, providing basic urban infrastructure services, and improving the operation of the urban land market. The preservation of Mali’s World Heritage sanctuaries is being undertaken in cooperation with UNESCO and local communities. This component includes the 15th century mosques of Djingareyber in Timbuktu, the archeological sites of Djenné-Jeno, the construction of a museum, and the cultural sites of Bandiagara-Dogon.
Revitalization of the Hafsia, District of Tunis
The Medina of Tunis is the historic core of the capital city. Culturally sensitive redevelopment of cleared sites could not arrest the deterioration that eroded the quality of the built environment and undermined the social fabric of the community. The World Bank, working with national and local authorities, formulated a multi-faceted revitalization strategy integrating preservation and development.

The focus of a pilot project initiated in 1982 was to attract private investment to redevelop vacant land and rehabilitate buildings, upgrade obsolete infrastructure and consolidate dilapidated structures in the poorer neighborhoods, and alleviate poverty by creating employment opportunities in construction and commercial activities.

This project also instituted an innovative credit mechanism to encourage residents to rehabilitate rental housing, and adopted simplified design guidelines developed by the Association for the Safeguard of the Medina to preserve the Medina's architectural heritage and ensure compatibility between the old and the new.

The success of the project and its spillover effects exceeded all expectations. Renovation and new construction added close to 75,000 square meters of floor space, created over 2,000 jobs, and increased population in the upgraded neighborhoods. Appreciating property values allowed the project to recover its costs, generate a surplus, and achieve a rate of return of 14 percent. The project was awarded the Aga Khan Award for Architecture.

Jordan, Second Tourism Development Project
Jordan’s exceptional cultural heritage is a major attraction for tourists. In 1996 more than one million tourists visited Jordan resulting in foreign exchange revenues of over US$750 million, or approximately ten percent of gross national product. Jordan, with the Bank’s assistance, is formulating a medium- to long-term Tourism Development Program to ensure the sector’s coherent and sustainable future.

The project’s development objectives are to create the conditions for environmentally sound and culturally sensitive tourism in Petra, Wadi Rum, Jerash, and Karak; to realize the tourism-related employment and income-generation potentials of these sites; and to improve infrastructure, environmental protection and site management at the two primary project sites—Wadi Rum and Petra.
Georgia Cultural Heritage Project

A Learning and Innovation Loan provided by the World Bank will fund technical assistance and investment for the protection and restoration of the following four cultural heritage pilot sites selected by the Georgian Cultural Heritage Initiative in consultation with local communities:

- old town of Tbilisi;
- village of Signaghi, in Georgia’s eastern wine-growing region;
- ancient cave city of Uplistsikhe; and
- mountain village of Shatili, in the northern Caucasus.

An Emergency Rehabilitation Fund will provide capital to the communities and eligible organizations. The Fund finances emergency repairs at cultural sites and the restoration of artifacts. In its second phase, the project will support high priority conservation activities at the four sites: facade and landscape improvements in historic monuments; the renovation of museums; the repair of historic homes; and the construction of touristic facilities and other community-based improvement activities. Future investments will promote public-private partnerships to develop the tourist industry and increase the participation of community groups and municipalities in protecting the local cultural heritage.

The Council of Europe and the governments of Italy and Netherlands are also providing technical assistance and funding.

Lahore Urban Development Project

With a population of more than three million making it the second-largest city of Pakistan, Lahore is the traditional commercial, industrial, and cultural center of the Punjab. It is the site of many important 17th century landmarks including the Wazir Khan, the Pearl and Golden mosques, the palace and mausoleum of Mogul Emperor Jahangir, and the Shalimar gardens.

In 1983 the Government of Pakistan and the World Bank initiated the Lahore Urban Development Project, a cultural heritage conservation plan for the Walled City. In 1988 US$1.3 million was allocated to the repair and restoration of the Delhi Gate, the principal entrance to the Walled City, and the Delhi Gate Bazaar and the Shahi Hammam, located inside the Delhi Gate, and restoration and rehabilitation of eight schools and two community centers. The project also addressed infrastructure and economic problems by financing the upgrading of the water supply, sewerage, drainage, paths and roadways, solid waste collection, electricity, and traffic management.
Indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian Peoples Development Project in Ecuador

This is the first World Bank-financed operation specifically focusing on indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian peoples. They belong to 15 different ethnic groups and make up approximately 30 percent of the Ecuadorian population. They are among the poorest of the poor.

A loan of US$50 million, approved in January 1998 and co-financed by the International Fund for Agricultural Development, focuses on approximately 815,000 persons of indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian origin in rural areas. The loan supports institutional strengthening of local membership organizations and communities; regularization of land and water rights; rural investments; and institutional strengthening of the Consejo Nacional de Planificación y Desarrollo de los Pueblos Indígenas.

This highly participatory project provides an opportunity for the indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian peoples of Ecuador to take the process of development into their own hands.

Lijang Earthquake Reconstruction Program

The 1996 Yunnan earthquake, measuring 7.0 on the Richter scale, resulted in significant damage to the old city of Lijang, a World Heritage Site. The World Bank responded quickly through its Yunnan Earthquake Reconstruction Program, amending an existing credit line to enable US$24 million in reconstruction support, including a cultural heritage component of US$8 million.

Lijang is an increasingly important tourist center; however low-income levels and dislocation from the earthquake put at risk local efforts to restore and maintain its historic and scenic center. The World Bank cooperated with the local administration to make emergency repairs, focusing on the needs of the displaced poor population. It simultaneously prepared options to preserve the unique architecture of the region.

Restoration was undertaken on Mu Minority Cultural Areas, public buildings, private family dwellings, and the supporting infrastructure. This emergency intervention demonstrated the ability to address community needs and the preservation of the cultural heritage concurrently.
Acknowledgments

First and foremost, I would like to express deep gratitude to Jim Wolfensohn, President of the World Bank, for his visionary leadership which has brought culture into the mainstream of development thinking, as we sharpen our focus on poverty reduction and helping people help themselves. His inspiring words and untiring support are what made this exhibition and catalogue possible. More importantly, he has empowered Bank staff and their counterparts in the developing countries and their partners in other international agencies to provide support to real actions on the ground, only a small part of which are reflected in this exhibition.

Many people and organizations are responsible for the extraordinary effort that has resulted in the exhibition and its catalogue, *Culture and Development at the Millennium: The Challenge and the Response*. The exhibition was built around the great work being done in cultural heritage and development by the international organizations that are represented here by just a small fraction of their activities and projects. We wish to thank the leadership of these organizations for sharing with us so freely the material and advice that went into the exhibition and catalogue: UNESCO, The Getty Conservation Institute, The Aga Khan Trust for Culture, International Center for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM), Organization of American States, Council of Europe, Smithsonian Institution, World Monuments Fund, and Inter-American Development Bank.

It was no easy task to pull together the hundreds of photographs and thousands of words of text into a visually stunning exhibit. But this was achieved with great skill and speed by a design team under the direction of François Vigier, Director of the Unit for Housing and Urbanization, Graduate School of Design, Harvard University. A special acknowledgment must be extended to the Harvard University design team composed of Jenny Elkus, Suzanne Kim, David Neilson, Mona Serageldin, and Wesley Wirth.

Heartfelt thanks to Tom Fieger, Charles Maltbie, and Steve Philpott of the Charles Maltbie Associates, exhibition fabricators.

Many World Bank colleagues gave their time and expertise in building the content of the exhibition. We thank most heartily Christina Bogyo, Kreszentia Duer, Katriniska Ebbe, Yoko Eguchi, Mohammed D.E. Feghoul, Arlene K. Fleming, Bjorn-Soren Gigler, Gita Hemphil, Tomoko Hirata, Toshihiko Keicho, Maritta Koch-Weser, Joan Martin-Brown, Betsy McGean, Geoffrey Read, Ephim Shluger, and Stephen R. Sterr.

Contributions came from far and wide in the form of written material, editorial assistance, photographs and consultation. The individuals represent many organizations and live in many parts of the world, which made this effort truly a worldwide partnership. Heartfelt thanks for their contribution in this creative enterprise go Mahasti Afshar, Neville Agnew, Guillermo Aldana, Stefano Bianca, Donelle Blubbaugh, M. Botchoizde, Karim Burneo, Curt Carnemark, Sue Carpenter, Michael Christen, David Coulson, Mikhail De Thyse, Martha Flach, John W. Franklin, Thomas Flynn, Cecile Goli, Kevin Healy, Willie Heinz, Awar Hossein, Vera H. Hyatt, A.D.C. Hyland, Pervez Khan, Richard Kennedy, Alan Kolata, Tom Lamb, John C. Lewis, Terry Little, David Mangurian, F. Manzaneiro, Sara Meneses, Frank Method, Susan Middleton, Valerie Muess, Robin Oldacre, Cameron Rashit, Geay Reha, William O'Reilly, Francesca Piquel, Linda Poole, Sonia Ramzi, Eduardo Rojas, Nancy Rosoff, Dolly Saengswang, J. Sanday, J. Stubbs, Vetsma Vujicik, the National Library of Jamaica and Jamaica National Heritage Trust.

The creation and production of the exhibition catalogue was managed by Sheldon Lippman who worked closely with designer Marc Meadows in reinterpreting the exhibition into book form. You hold in your hands their work which is acknowledged and thanked. Contributions came from far and wide in the form of written material, editorial assistance, photographs and consultation. The individuals represent many organizations and live in many parts of the world, which made this effort truly a worldwide partnership. Heartfelt thanks for their contribution in this creative enterprise go Mahasti Afshar, Neville Agnew, Guillermo Aldana, Stefano Bianca, Donelle Blubbaugh, M. Botchoizde, Karim Burneo, Curt Carnemark, Sue Carpenter, Michael Christen, David Coulson, Mikhail De Thyse, Martha Flach, John W. Franklin, Thomas Flynn, Cecile Goli, Kevin Healy, Willie Heinz, Awar Hossein, Vera H. Hyatt, A.D.C. Hyland, Pervez Khan, Richard Kennedy, Alan Kolata, Tom Lamb, John C. Lewis, Terry Little, David Mangurian, F. Manzaneiro, Sara Meneses, Frank Method, Susan Middleton, Valerie Muess, Robin Oldacre, Cameron Rashit, Geay Reha, William O'Reilly, Francesca Piquel, Linda Poole, Sonia Ramzi, Eduardo Rojas, Nancy Rosoff, Dolly Saengswang, J. Sanday, J. Stubbs, Vetsma Vujicik, the National Library of Jamaica and Jamaica National Heritage Trust.

The creation and production of the exhibition catalogue was managed by Sheldon Lippman who worked closely with designer Marc Meadows in reinterpreting the exhibition into book form. You hold in your hands their work which is acknowledged and thanked. Contributions came from far and wide in the form of written material, editorial assistance, photographs and consultation. The individuals represent many organizations and live in many parts of the world, which made this effort truly a worldwide partnership. Heartfelt thanks for their contribution in this creative enterprise go Mahasti Afshar, Neville Agnew, Guillermo Aldana, Stefano Bianca, Donelle Blubbaugh, M. Botchoizde, Karim Burneo, Curt Carnemark, Sue Carpenter, Michael Christen, David Coulson, Mikhail De Thyse, Martha Flach, John W. Franklin, Thomas Flynn, Cecile Goli, Kevin Healy, Willie Heinz, Awar Hossein, Vera H. Hyatt, A.D.C. Hyland, Pervez Khan, Richard Kennedy, Alan Kolata, Tom Lamb, John C. Lewis, Terry Little, David Mangurian, F. Manzaneiro, Sara Meneses, Frank Method, Susan Middleton, Valerie Muess, Robin Oldacre, Cameron Rashit, Geay Reha, William O'Reilly, Francesca Piquel, Linda Poole, Sonia Ramzi, Eduardo Rojas, Nancy Rosoff, Dolly Saengswang, J. Sanday, J. Stubbs, Vetsma Vujicik, the National Library of Jamaica and Jamaica National Heritage Trust.

The creation and production of the exhibition catalogue was managed by Sheldon Lippman who worked closely with designer Marc Meadows in reinterpreting the exhibition into book form. You hold in your hands their work which is acknowledged and thanked. Contributions came from far and wide in the form of written material, editorial assistance, photographs and consultation. The individuals represent many organizations and live in many parts of the world, which made this effort truly a worldwide partnership. Heartfelt thanks for their contribution in this creative enterprise go Mahasti Afshar, Neville Agnew, Guillermo Aldana, Stefano Bianca, Donelle Blubbaugh, M. Botchoizde, Karim Burneo, Curt Carnemark, Sue Carpenter, Michael Christen, David Coulson, Mikhail De Thyse, Martha Flach, John W. Franklin, Thomas Flynn, Cecile Goli, Kevin Healy, Willie Heinz, Awar Hossein, Vera H. Hyatt, A.D.C. Hyland, Pervez Khan, Richard Kennedy, Alan Kolata, Tom Lamb, John C. Lewis, Terry Little, David Mangurian, F. Manzaneiro, Sara Meneses, Frank Method, Susan Middleton, Valerie Muess, Robin Oldacre, Cameron Rashit, Geay Reha, William O'Reilly, Francesca Piquel, Linda Poole, Sonia Ramzi, Eduardo Rojas, Nancy Rosoff, Dolly Saengswang, J. Sanday, J. Stubbs, Vetsma Vujicik, the National Library of Jamaica and Jamaica National Heritage Trust.

Finally, very special thanks to Carol Reed, the project manager for the exhibition, who coordinated the massive amount of material from worldwide sources and ensured its assembly into what has become the World Bank's first broad-based public statement on culture and development.

Ismail Serageldin
An edition of 6,000 copies printed
September 1998

The text of this book is composed in Times
with ranging numerals and expert
characters, along with Monotype Castellar
for initial caps and titling, on a power
Macintosh in QuarkXPress Passport.