Implementation Status & Results

India

India First Statistical Strengthening Project (P108489)

Project Name: India First Statistical Strengthening Project (P108489)  
Program Stage: Implementation  
Seq.No: 1  
Status: ARCHIVED  
Last Modified Date: 29-Apr-2011

Country: India  
Approval FY: 2010

Product Line: IBRD/IDA  
Region: SOUTH ASIA  
Lending Instrument: Development Policy Lending

Implementing Agency(ies): Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation

Key Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board Approval Date</td>
<td>01-Jun-2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Closing Date</td>
<td>30-Jul-2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned Mid Term Review Date</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Closing Date</td>
<td>30-Jul-2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual Mid Term Review Date</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness Date</td>
<td>11-Aug-2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Closing Date</td>
<td>30-Jul-2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Document)

The objective of the proposed Statistical Strengthening Loan is to support the implementation of a GoI centrally sponsored scheme to strengthen state statistical systems within a national framework. This loan is formally part of CAS outcome I, achieving rapid, inclusive growth, by improving the coverage and quality of official statistics generally and by supporting the implementation of a reform program for the statistical system in the states it will also support the other outcomes. In particular, by working directly to strengthen the results process in States and Union Territories it will also provide direct support to monitoring and evaluation of all Bank operations.

Has the Program Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Program?

☐ Yes  ☐ No

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td></td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementation Status Overview

The India First Statistical Strengthening Loan (SSL) was approved by the Board on June 1, 2010 and became effective on August 11, 2010. At the request of Government of India, the money was fully disbursed on September 23, 2010. All loan conditions were fully met at the time of the Board approval and there was no condition attached to the withdrawal of funds.

The November mission Aide Memoire noted that the overall pace of implementation has been slow and protracted in the first few months of implementation. Intensive efforts on the part of MoSPI are required to achieve satisfactory progress by the loan closing date, July 31st 2011. As a result of recent discussions with the Bank team, some positive measures by the Chief Statistician of India (CSI) on accelerating the pace of implementation and improving the coordination with states and other agencies has been possible. However, considerable challenges remain ahead in achieving satisfactory progress. Some progress has taken place since the November mission and the MOSPI team is making efforts in meeting the targets set out under the four policy areas in the program matrix of the loan. Some notable achievements are evident in terms of considerable ownership of reforms at the state level with 32 states/UTs signing the Letters of Participation against a target of at least 7 states/UTs as in the program matrix. Another achievement is the establishment of the institutional framework as set out in the Program Document both at the central level and the state level. At the center, both the High Level Steering Committee for ISSP and
Conference of Central and State Statistical Organizations (COCSSO) have been spearheading and closely monitoring the implementation of the ISSP by the states. The National Strategic Statistical Plan (2008) is under implementation and a timetable has been put in place to update and publish a revised Plan keeping in line with the 3 year cycle of revisions as per the Program Matrix. The National Statistical Commission (NSC) is currently reviewing the overall state statistical system and there is a committee that is looking after the implementation of the recommendations of the Rangarajan Report (2001) on which the India SSL is based. The program matrix intermediate target on publication of manuals has been met since CSO has published an additional two manuals during implementation. The National Academy of Statistical Administration (NASA) has piloted a training needs assessment for four states which is scheduled to be completed by July 2011.

MOSPI is however lagging behind in the completion of the State Strategic Statistical Plans (SSSPs). The intermediate target was to complete 7 SSSPs and 3 MOUs by December 2010. So far, only 3 SSSPs (Karnataka, Rajasthan and Gujarat) have received cabinet approval and only one MOU has been signed between the GOI and Govt. of Karnataka. The slow progress in this particular area stems from several implementation impediments and lack of coordination between the center and the states. These implementation issues if not addressed properly can risk timely achievement of results. Some of the key issues as noted in the mission Aide Memoire are:

➢ Coordination: The High Level Steering Committee under the Chairmanship of the Secretary, MOSPI has been meeting regularly to discuss the implementation of ISSP. MOSPI agreed on the Bank team’s view that there is a need to strengthen the coordination between the CAP, Program Support Group and Technical Support Group (TSG). The Bank team also stressed on the need to involve the Statistical Advisors in the central line ministries in the reform program and cast the net wide for ISSP. Even though MOSPI has taken significant measures to integrate the state line ministries into the project but the involvement of the central line ministries still remains a concern. It is expected that MOSPI will undertake a series of consultative workshops/meetings with these statistical advisors in order to engage them in the ISSP.

➢ Strengthening of the Technical Support Group: A technical support group (TSG) exists within MOSPI under DDG (CAP) to assist the states in the preparation of SSSPs. It was discussed during the mission that TSG will be strengthened by including senior level officers (ADGs) from CAP and FOD as well as from different sectors for e.g. National Accounts Division (NAD), Economic Statistics Division (ESD) etc. The TSG would assist in reviewing the different SSSPs and also provide necessary handholding to states/UTs as needed during the implementation phase of the SSSPs.

➢ Regular Process of Engagement: During the mission MOSPI and the Bank emphasized on the need of a regular process of engagement with the state officials which will be essential for successful implementation of ISSP. To speed-up the process of preparation of SSSPs in states, the Chief Statistician of India (CSI) had already met with the Chief Secretaries of a few states. Furthermore, the Chief Statistician of India (CSI) will be holding meetings with the Field Operation Division DDGs posted in the states/UTs and discuss and streamline their work plan for ISSP. It is expected that the meetings between the Secretary and the DDGs will be held on a quarterly basis.

➢ Need for frequent Implementation Support Missions: Given the performance towards the progress benchmarks and the gap between realized and planned targets, Bank team is ready to support MOSPI and will be glad to conduct more frequent implementation support missions. As agreed, Bank will conduct these missions every two months till the loan closing date of July 31, 2011 to jointly review the progress on agreed results.

➢ Monitoring Framework: A monitoring framework for the ISSP and draft reporting forms to assess the progress of preparation as well as implementation of SSSPs was developed by the Bank and shared with MOSPI during the mission. It was decided that the proposed template will be circulated to all departments and divisions within MOSPI and comments/feedback will be solicited to establish the monitoring framework and enhance it further. The same monitoring framework will be sent to all the state based DDGs by CAP division. The DDGs will be meeting regularly with the Directors of DES and will report to the senior management of MOSPI according to a specified time interval to be decided by MOSPI.

➢ Manpower and Weak Implementation Capacity: Manpower and weak implementation capacity is a major issue for the states/UTs. There is wide recognition of these constraints and the permanent National Statistical Commission along with MOSPI is currently discussing ways to address the issue. The permanent NSC is looking at the recommendations of the Vaidyanathan Committee on improving the agriculture statistics generated by the states and estimation of green GDP which include specific recommendations for the development of the state statistical manpower. Based on the agriculture pilot, MOSPI will plan to develop strategies to assist the states/UTs in addressing capacity constraints. MOSPI will soon issue guidelines on the use of TFC grant to the states/ UTs. Depending on the modality of the guidelines some of the vacant posts in the states can be filled with the grant money.

➢ Technical Assistance from MOSPI to the Participating States/UTs: Discussions were carried out with MOSPI on the key areas where the participating states/UTs would need technical assistance to perform the activities to be undertaken under ISSP. Presently technical assistance is needed to improve coordination mechanisms, manage data quality, develop data banks, determine an appropriate ICT strategy, develop electronic dissemination of data and metadata or technical advice related to the design of particular statistical
activities. MOSPI will provide this support through training programs, workshops, joint review missions and the provision of common guidance. Special emphasis would be put on joint review missions that enable to create a platform for the states/UTs to voice their concerns and needs.

- Non-Lending Technical Assistance (NLTA) from the Bank to MOSPI: Non-lending technical assistance (NLTA) to MOSPI through the Trust Fund for Statistical Capacity Building (TFSCB) which ended in June 2010 played a catalytic role during the period of preparation of the ISSP. The Bank provided TFSCB support for preparation of the NSSP, SSSP guidelines, monitoring framework, draft MOU, holding of regional workshops and hiring of consultants for SSSPs. Consultations were carried out with MOSPI during the mission for further NLTA which will be needed to achieve the results under the policy areas I-IV during the implementation phase of ISSP. The need for a complementary support and technical advice is evident from the mission discussions. MOSPI has agreed to prepare a concept note for the follow-on TA support.

**Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Results Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator Name</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National Statistical Commission
Report published, August 2001
Chairman and members of the permanent NSC appointed, July 2006.
Director General CSO post filled after a gap of 9 years, June 2006.
First Chief Statistician of India (CSI) appointment, February 2007.
The National Statistical Commission has, on April 30, 2008, endorsed the National Strategic Statistical Plan, which is now the guiding policy document for the national statistical system in India.

Date
17-Apr-2010

Comment
These are the agreed actions taken during 2007-2009 before the signing of the loan

The National Strategic Statistical Plan (NSSP) is in the process of being implementation.
The NSP will be updated once a few SSSPs have been implemented on the ground.
The proposed rules under the #Collection of Statistics Act 2008# have been prepared and have been submitted to the Legislative Department for review.
The NSC is currently reviewing the national statistical system. A committee has been constituted to discuss the issue of providing statutory basis for NSC which will strengthen the statistical capacity at the Centre.
The HLSC for ISSP met five times in 2010 to review the progress of ISSP in states, to discuss strengthening the capacity of the PSG, and to review and revise the draft Karnataka MoU. The frequency of the HLSC is determined as per need(s) ISSP has become a permanent agenda item for the annual COCSSO meetings. The 18th COCSSO meeting reviewed the progress of ISSP in various states and made a number of recommendations for ISSP Capacity assessments are being completed as part of the preparation of State Strategic Statistical Plans (SSSPs). These have been finalized in three states (Karnataka, Rajasthan and Gujarat) and have been drafted in a further seven states (Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Haryana, Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Orissa and West Bengal). Progress is being made in five more states (Assam, Delhi, Himachal Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh and Rajasthan).

By end 2010: Process identified and timetable agreed to review NSSP and update, if required.
By 2015:
Outcomes:
# NSC provides independent overview and assessment of the National Statistical System.
# CSI provides strategic leadership to improve the operational efficiency of the Statistical system.
# Appropriate legal framework for statistical system in place in line with NSC 2001 recommendations and UN principles.
# There has been an increase in the operational efficiency of the decentralized statistical system
# Coordination between the Center and States/UTs strengthened.

Indicators:
# NSC prepares and publishes an annual report on the national statistical system.
# NSSP reviewed at least once every three years.
# CSI position remains filled
# Collection of Statistics Act, 2008 embodies the UN principles
# Rules under the framework of Collection of Statistics Act, 2008 are in place
# Act to provide the permanent NSC with a statutory basis is in place
# Number of States have participated in ISSP and have implemented a program of reforms and capacity strengthening
# COCSSO continues to monitor ISSP and to publish regular reports.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicator Name</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Increasing Support from the Center to States

National standards for eight key statistical activities have been prepared, approved, and disseminated.

The budget for ISSP of Rs650 crores has been approved of which Rs 130 crores is financed by GoI.

The necessary institutional capacity required to support the implementation of the ISSP has been established.

Senior Statistical Officers from MOSPI posted in States are working to strengthen coordination between the Center and State/UT Governments.

Senior Statistical Officers posted at line Ministries of GoI to improve coordination Guidelines on strategic planning for States have been prepared and disseminated by MOSPI.

Information about the ISSP, including the progress of reforms, has been disseminated through the dedicated MOSPI web site.

Date 17-Apr-2010

Comment

These are the agreed actions taken during 2007-2009

Manuals on 10 key statistical activities have been finalized. Financial and Banking Statistics and Agricultural Prices and Marketing) are in the draft stage which will be finalized soon.

The Project Support Group (PSG) is functioning under the overall supervision and guidance of Director General, CSO. The other supporting officers are ADG (SSD), ADG (CAP) and ADG (NASA). A Technical Support Group (TSG) has also been constituted which is headed by DDG (CAP). This TSG is functioning under ADG (SSD).

The state level/state coordinators Deputy Directors General (DDGs) of the, National Sample Survey Organisation, Field Operations Division [NSSO (FOD)] posted in the States are also given the responsibility to guide, as and when required, the state government in preparation of SSSP.

As per MoU signed with Karnataka, MOSPI released Rs. 1193.61 lakhs (US$ 2.65 million) on Dec 30, 2010.

For the preparation of the SSSP, Rs.10 lakhs (Approx. US$ 22000) were given to all the participating states.

MOSPI has been spearheading the roll-out of the SSSP/ISSP and has been involved in assisting the states both technically and financially. However, the nature of the support has been targeted towards overcoming the primary roadblocks # Dissemination of information/knowledge and about administrative steps that need to be undertaken to participate in ISSP.

By end 2010:

National standards (manuals) for at least a further two key statistical activities are published in final form by CSO and five are under development.

PSG is strengthened based on the requirements of SSSPs preparation.

At least 10 per cent of the ISSP budget has been transferred to the States.

MOSPI have identified the needs for further technical assistance by the time the current trust fund has ended. If required, a proposal for non-lending TA will have been prepared by MOSPI.

MOSPI provide technical support to participating states.

Progress on ISSP is being reported regularly through the MOSPI web-site.

By 2015:

Outcomes:

# Standards have been established.
# States are able to access the technical support needed to improve state statistical systems.
# States statistical systems are able to access the financial resources needed to build and maintain statistical capacity.

Indicators:

# Manuals on key statistical activities are published.
# Disbursement of ISSP funds to States/UTs.
# Changes in State/UT’s budget allocations for statistics.
# Number of training courses organized by the Center.

Targets to be achieved by end 2010 and by 2015 are mentioned.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicator Name</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Strengthening the Capacity and Performance of State Statistical Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Unit of Measure</th>
<th>Custom Indicator Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detailed assessment of statistical systems in all 35 States/UTs completed and synthesis report published in April 2008.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letters to Chief Secretaries/Administrators inviting participation in the ISSP issued April 2008.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The governments of seven States/UTs have indicated their commitment to the Program by signing Letters of Participation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 States/UTs have designated the DES or its equivalents as a nodal agency for all statistical activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The baseline assessment of the State statistical systems includes estimates of the potential staffing gap as well as an identification of low priority tasks.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Academy of Statistical Administration (NASA), central statistical training institute also supports States’ training needs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-service training provided regularly to improve knowledge and skills in States (for e.g. National Accounts and National Sample Survey).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**State Strategic Statistical Plans (SSSPs)** have been completed and approved in three states and are in final draft form in seven more, awaiting approval of the State Government.

- Karnataka signed the MoU with government of India (GoI) on Dec 10, 2010. Rajasthan and Gujarat are in the process of signing their MOUs on March 24 and March 31, 2011 respectively.
- High Level Steering Committees for ISSP have been established in 24 States.
- The centre has released an advance of Rs. 10 lakh (over US $22,000) for preparation of SSSP to 31 states.
- Karnataka has received its first installment of ISSP funds of Rs. 1193.61 lakhs ($2.65 million) for implementation of SSSP.
- PSG completes a first review of the ISSP monitoring and reporting system and submits recommendations to the High-level Steering Committee.

**By end 2010:**
- At least seven States/UTs have prepared SSSPs.
- At least three States have signed MoUs with MOSPI.
- High-level State Steering Committees are in place in all participating States and have met at least twice.
- At least 10 per cent of the funding requirements identified in MoUs have been transferred to states.
- Those states that have signed MoUs have provided at least one progress report to MOSPI and these reports have been considered by the High-level Steering Committee.

**By 2015:**
- Outcomes:
  - # States develop strategy for sustainable improvement in their statistical system within the broad context of NSSP.
  - # Performance of State/UT statistical systems has improved.
  - # Improvement in the operation of DES as nodal agencies to fulfill their functions. The coordination within States/UTs has improved.
  - # The manpower involved in State statistical systems functioning is better prepared to carry out jobs.
- Indicators:
  - # SSSPs are in place in all participating States.
  - # Majority of participating States.

**Date**
17-Apr-2010

**Comment**
These are the agreed actions taken during 2007-2009.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicator Name</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Improving the Quality and Coverage of Statistics Generated by States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Unit of Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Custom Indicator</td>
<td>Text</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An assessment report on the statistical capacities and needs of the States/UTs has been published.

15th COCSSO decision for States/UTs to establish dedicated websites.

The SSSP guidelines require States/UTs to consult all stakeholders.

All States/UTs requested to observe June 29 as Statistics Day every year. In 2009 the focus was on price statistics.

Participating States/UTs supported by MOSPI to include plans to compile and publish appropriate metadata for key statistics in their SSSPs.

Manuals on key statistics provide guidance on metadata.

Date
17-Apr-2010

Comment
These are the agreed actions taken during 2007-2009.

Targets, actions and strategies are set out in SSSPs. These have been completed in three states and are near finalization in six more.

Only Karnataka has published an advance release calendar. Gujarat and Rajasthan have not yet done so.

Karnataka and Delhi have individual statistical web-sites. In almost all other states DES web pages are included in the state government’s web-site.

Date
25-Mar-2011

Comment
By end 2010:
At least three participating States/UTs identify the actions and strategies required to improve the quality of key statistics and these plans are set out in the MoUs.

In a further six states priorities and targets have been agreed for key statistics and these have been set out in the SSSPs.

Advance release calendars on GSDP and other agreed key statistics are prepared in at least three participating States/UTs.

At least half of participating States are disseminating State statistics through web-sites and other electronic media.

By 2015:
Outcomes:
# States' own statistical needs are also met.
# The coverage and quality of key statistics activities is improved.
# Better accessibility to data.
# Improved interaction with data users.

Indicators:
# In all participating States, at least 80% of the performance indicators set out in MoUs have been achieved.
# Number of key statistics published.
# Improvements in the quality assessments of States based on the key statistical activities covered in the MoUs.
# Data dissemination and access policy in place in participating States.
# An advance release calendar is in place for all key statistics.

Date
31-Jul-2011

Comment
Targets to be achieved by end 2010 and by 2015 are mentioned.
Data on Financial Performance (as of 23-Sep-2010)

Financial Agreement(s) Key Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan No.</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P108489</td>
<td>IBRD-77960</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>01-Jun-2010</td>
<td>09-Jul-2010</td>
<td>11-Aug-2010</td>
<td>30-Jul-2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disbursements (in Millions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan No.</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>% Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P108489</td>
<td>IBRD-77960</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>107.00</td>
<td>107.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>107.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tranches

Tranche 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amount (USD)</th>
<th>Expected Release Date</th>
<th>Actual Release Date</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Released</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Decisions Regarding Implementation

Bank to have more frequent implementation support missions. The Program Support Group of ISSP should intensify its efforts to address and support the preparation of SSSPs at the state level. A monitoring framework for tracking progress state-wise based on the international consultant's framework should be adopted in order to address implementation impediments at the state level. The Chief Statistician of India will be actively involved in the implementation of the ISSP through the High Level Steering Committee. Delays in reporting matters pertaining to ISSP and weak coordination should be addressed by the High Level Steering Committee and appropriate timely actions are taken to speed up the implementation process.

Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Operations

P108489-India First Statistical Strengthening Project